Tydskrif vir Taalonderrig - Journal for Language Teaching - Ijenali yokuFundisa iLimi - IJenali yokuFundisa iiLwimi -Ibhuku Lokufundisa Ulimi - Tšenale ya tša Go ruta Polelo - Buka ya Thuto ya Puo - Jenale ya Thuto ya Dipuo - Ijenali Yekufundzisa Lulwimi - Jena?a va u Gudisa Nvambo - Jenala yo Dyondzisa Ririmi - Tydskrif vir Taalonderrig -Journal for Language Teaching - Ijenali yokuFundisa iLimi - IJenali yokuFundisa iiLwimi - Ibhuku Lokufundisa Ulimi - Tšenale ya tša Go ruta Polelo - Buka ya Thuto ya Puo -Jenale ya Thuto ya Dipuo - Ijenali Yekufundzisa Lulwimi - Jena?a ya u Gudisa Nyambo - Jenala yo Dyondzisa Ririmi - Tydskrif vir Taalonderrig - Journal for Language Teaching - Ijenali yokuFundisa iLimi - IJenali yokuFundisa iiLwimi - Ibhuku Lokufundisa Ulimi - Tšenale ya tša Go ruta Polelo - Buka ya Thuto ya Puo - Jenale ya Thuto ya Dipuo -Ijenali Yekufundzisa Lulwimi - Jena?a ya u Gudisa Nyambo - Jenala yo Dyondzisa Ririmi - Tydskrif vir Taalonderrig - Journal for Language Teaching - Ijenali yokuFundisa iLimi -IJenali vokuFundisa iiLwimi - Ibhuku Lokufundisa Ulimi - Tšenale ya tša Go ruta Polelo -Buka ya Thuto ya Puo - Jenale ya Thuto ya Dipuo - Ijenali Yekufundzisa Lulwimi - Jena?a ya u Gudisa Nyambo - Jenala Dyondzisa Ririmi - Tydskrif vir Taalonderrig - Journal for Language Teaching - Ijenali yokuFundisa iLimi - IJenali yokuFundisa iiLwimi -Ibhuku Lokufundisa Ulimi - Tšenale ya tša Go ruta Polelo - Buka ya Thuto ya Puo - Jenale ya Thuto ya Dipuo - Ijenali Yekufundzisa Lulwimi - Jena?a ya u Gudisa Nyambo - Jenala yo Dyondzisa Ririmi - Tydskrif vir Taalonderrig - Journal for Language Teaching - Ijenali yokuFundisa iLimi - IJenali yokuFundisa iiLwimi - Ibhuku Lokufundisa Ulimi -Tšenale ya tša Go ruta Polelo - Buka ya Thuto ya Puo -Jenale ya Thuto ya Dipuo - Ijenali Yekufundzisa Lulwimi - Jena?a ya u Gudisa Nyambo - Jenala yo Dyondzisa Ririmi - Tydskrif vir Taalonderrig - Journal for Language Teaching - Ijenali yokuFundisa iLimi - IJenali yokuFundisa iiLwimi - Ibhuku Lokufundisa Ulimi - Tšenale ya tša Go ruta Polelo - Buka ya Thuto ya Puo - Jenale ya Thuto ya Dipuo -Ijenali Yekufundzisa Lulwimi - Jena?a ya u Gudisa Nyambo - Jenala yo Dyondzisa Ririmi - Tydskrif vir Taalonderrig -Journal for Language Teaching - Ijenali yokuFundisa iLimi - IJenali yokuFundisa iiLwimi - Ibhuku Lokufundisa Ulimi - Tšenale ya tša Go ruta Polelo - Buka ya Thuto ya Puo -Jenale ya Thuto ya Dipuo - Ijenali Yekufundzisa Lulwimi - Jena?a ya u Gudisa Nyambo - Jenala yo Dyondzisa Ririmi - - Tydskrif vir Taalonderrig - Journal for Language Teaching - Ijenali yokuFundisa iLimi - IJenali yokuFundisa iiLwimi - Ibhuku Lokufundisa Ulimi - Tšenale ya tša Go ruta

Christa Thornhill

(Cape Peninsula University of Technology) and

Michael le Cordeur

(Stellenbosch University)

First additional language teaching in selected grade 4 – 6 classes in Western Cape urban schools: The case of Afrikaans

Abstract

This study investigates the current state of Afrikaans First Additional Language (FAL) teaching in Gr 4 - 6 classes in Western Cape urban schools against the background of the national drive towards the promotion of multilingualism among the learners of South African schools. Based on Vygotsky's theory that learning is a process where an expert leads the child to internalise new knowledge as well as Shulman's theoretical framework that addresses the professional knowledge base of teachers, this study used a mixed methods approach to generate empirical data. The literature study provides an overview of the major methodologies relevant to FAL teaching, whilst the questionnaires, completed by Grade 4 – 6 Afrikaans FAL teachers, provided the quantitative data. For the qualitative strand of the study, semi-structured interviews were conducted with Afrikaans FAL teachers. The study showed that the teachers' knowledge of the

curriculum, language policies, language teaching and learning theories as well as methodologies is extremely limited and revealed that teachers are caught up in traditional language teaching methods and strategies which do not contribute to the enhancement of learners' proficiency in the target language. It is therefore recommended that there is no single method that will ensure effective FAL teaching, but teachers should implement an eclectic approach to achieve the best results. Furthermore, initial teacher training programmes and in-service training workshops should be adapted in order to prepare teachers adequately to implement the prescribed curriculum using appropriate methodologies and strategies.

Key words: constructivism, curriculum, eclectic approach, language policies, multilingualism, pedagogical content knowledge.

1. Introduction

Various policy documents, such as the Constitution, the National Language Policy, the Western Cape Education Department (WCED) Language in Education Transformation Plan and the National Curriculum Statement (NCS) encourage multilingualism. It is stated very clearly that the home language and a first additional language should take priority in primary education through the process of additive bilingualism. The WCED Language in Education Transformation Plan (Western Cape Education Department, 2007:5) states that all three official languages spoken in the province – namely, Afrikaans, English and Xhosa – should be promoted and developed on an equitable basis. The Language-in-Education Policy (LiEP) of the Department of Education (Department of Education, 1997a: 1) emphasises the importance of additional language teaching, "while providing access to and the effective acquisition of additional language(s)." Both the Revised National Curriculum Statement (RNCS) and the Curriculum Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS) (DOE, 2002; 2011b) clearly states that the first additional language should be introduced as a subject in Grade 1. However, the question arises whether the practical implementation at school level of these policies corresponds with the sentiment expressed in these policies. Feedback from students returning from practice teaching indicates that not enough time is being set aside by schools for the instruction and acquisition of Afrikaans First Additional Language (FAL).

2. Problem Statement

The results of CPUT Afrikaans proficiency tests written by first-year students over the past ten years show a marked deterioration in the Afrikaans proficiency of first-year English home language teacher education students. According to Nel and Müller (2010), teachers' limited English proficiency has a negative impact on English second language learners' proficiency in English. Thus the researchers will argue that teachers' limited Afrikaans proficiency will have the same negative impact on their learners' proficiency in Afrikaans. This problem is not limited to South Africa.

According to McLaughlin (1998:70), the "implementation problem" already existed in the USA in the early 1970s. The Rand Change Agent study (McLaughlin, 1998:71) found that "it is exceedingly difficult for policy to change practice" and that even if teachers in a particular site might be eager to embrace new policies, these policies might not be implemented because of a lack of support from their institution. In both the RNCS (Department of Education, 2002) and Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statements (CAPS) (Department of Basic Education, 2011b), the communicative approach to FAL teaching is recommended. The researchers have reason to believe that the communication method is not always applied as recommended by the RNCS and CAPS.

3. Theoretical framework

Shulman (1987) emphasises the importance of teachers' pedagogical content knowledge

(PCK) of how to teach the subject content effectively. PCK enables the teacher to effectively adapt the same content to diverse groups of learners and teaching situations. He focuses upon the "teacher's ability to reason about teaching and to teach specific topics, and to base his or her actions on premises that can bear the scrutiny of the professional community" (Shulman, 1987: 20). He suggests that a distinction is made among three categories of content knowledge: "(a) subject matter content knowledge, (b) pedagogical content knowledge, and (c) curricular knowledge" (Shulman, 1986: 9). Part of the teachers' PCK should be knowledge of constructivism and social-constructivism in order to meet the learners where they are at and to facilitate their growth and development to a higher level of knowledge and competence. The Foundations for Learning (Republic of South Africa, 2008) regard the teacher's scaffolding of the language learner as one of the teacher's most important tasks in the learner's journey to become a skilled and functional reader. The teacher's support should provide a scaffold for the learner in developing all the language skills. The researchers therefore focus on the importance of the zone of proximal development (ZPD) in the language teaching and learning process, and on the vital role that teachers and other more knowledgeable peers have to play in guiding the learners through collaboration to reach a higher level of proficiency in the target language.

4. Research Question

The study focused on the research question: "What is the state of Afrikaans FAL teaching in the intermediate phase in Western Cape urban schools?"

In order to investigate the different elements of first additional language teaching, this research question was divided into three sub-questions.

- 1. How knowledgeable are the teachers about the national, provincial and school language policies and plans for Afrikaans FAL in the intermediate phase and to what extent are these policies being implemented at urban WCED schools?
- 2. What is the level of training of FAL teachers in WCED urban schools and is it their perception that this training equipped them adequately to teach FAL in the intermediate phase?
- 3. What are teachers' perceptions about their methodologies and the use of resources to teach FAL effectively?

5. Method

For the purpose of this study, the convergent design (Creswell & Plano Clark, 2011: 180 – 185) of data collection was selected. In the convergent design the data collection involves collecting both quantitative and qualitative data concurrently, analysing the data

separately, and then merging the two databases. Because the purpose of this study is to use the data from the different strands to corroborate, directly compare and relate two sets of findings about the topic, the same participants were used in both the quantitative and qualitative samples. The two samples had different sizes, with the size of the quantitative sample much larger than the qualitative sample, which helped the researcher obtain an in-depth qualitative exploration and a rigorous quantitative examination of the topic. As Creswell and Plano Clark (2011: 184) state, the "quantitative data collection aims toward making generalisations to a population while qualitative data collection seeks to develop an in-depth understanding from a few people." Creswell and Plano Clark (2011) and Teddlie and Yu (2007) note that merging the two databases works best by asking parallel questions in both the qualitative and the quantitative data collection. By addressing the same concepts in both the qualitative and quantitative data collection, the two databases can be compared and merged" (Creswell & Plano Clark, 2011: 184). In the case of this study, two independent data sets were collected: the quantitative data (questionnaire) followed by the qualitative data (interviews).

6. Literature study

Many current educational issues, theories and practices can be understood better in terms of experiences from the past. The knowledge acquired from the historic literature review often offers valuable insights in terms of which the changes in the current education system as well as the practices and approaches can be investigated. The literature study also gives an accurate indication of whether those changes will be effective and sustainable.

Language policies

Language planning is seen by some as an organised search for ways to solve language problems (Bamgbose, 1991; Fishman, 1976). The language policies of apartheid South Africa gave certain languages an unfair advantage and failed to acknowledge the multilingual character of South Africa, which led to imbalances in civil society and educational systems (Heugh, 2008; De Varennes, 2010; Heugh & Skutnabb-Kangas, 2010;, Le Cordeur, 2011). The first democratically elected government of South Africa, which took office in 1994, committed itself to the promotion of constitutional multilingualism and the protection of language rights as a vehicle for social transformation. Section 29 (2) of the Constitution (Republic of South Africa, 1996a) states that "all citizens have the right to receive education in the official languages or languages of their choice in public educational institutions, where that education is reasonably practicable".

The National Education Policy Act, Act 27 of 1996 (Republic of South Africa, 1996b) and the South African Schools Act, Act 84 of 1996 (Republic of South Africa, 1996c) both supported the principle of multilingualism as expressed in the Constitution. The possibilities of multilingual education were explored and on 14 July 1997 the Language-in-Education Policy (LiEP) (Department of Education, 1997a), based on the principle of

additive bilingualism, was announced. This LiEP acknowledged the multilingual nature of South Africa and endorsed the individual's right to choose his/her language of learning and teaching (LoLT). It further stipulated that all learners shall offer one approved language as a subject in Grades 1 and 2; from Grade 3 onwards all learners shall offer at least one additional language over and above their LoLT. This is in accordance with scholars who maintain that effective literacy acquisition and second-language proficiency depend on well-developed first-language proficiency" (Le Cordeur, 2011; Heugh & Skutnabb-Kangas, 2010; Le Cordeur & Basson, 2014).

Of importance to education in the Western Cape is the Western Cape Provincial School Education Act, Act 12 of 1997 (WCP, 1997), and the Western Cape Provincial Languages Act, Act 13 of 1998 (WCP, 1998). The Language Policy in the Primary Schools of the Western Cape (Western Cape Education Department, 2002) was introduced in November 2002. The two central recommendations of this policy were, firstly, to implement the policy of mother-tongue-based bilingual education (MTBBE) in Grades R-6 from 2005 in all primary schools in the Western Cape Province, and secondly, to institute incentives to guide all learners towards electing to take the third official language of the Province as their second additional language (SAL).

Despite the apparent good intentions of the government and the WCED to promote and implement multilingual education, Plüddemann *et al.* (2004: 60), among others, are of the opinion that current language policies continue to advantage English (and Afrikaans) despite the government's claim of equality of all eleven official languages. Howie, Venter, Van Staden, Zimmerman, Long, Du Toit, Sherman and Archer (2008) found that the LiEP has not been uniformly implemented or advocated, and confirm that WCED primary schools are moving towards a model of subtractive multilingualism.

First Additional Language methods, methodologies and approaches

The purpose of FAL teaching is the development of proficiency in the target language in order to use that language effectively and naturally in authentic situations, such as during formal and informal conversations. Donato (1994: 34) describes the goal of communication as the "successful sending and receiving of linguistic tokens". Donato continues by stating that FAL communication expects teachers and learners to interact in a meaningful way. Although the RNCS (Department of Education, 2002) is not very clear about the methodology that Afrikaans FAL teachers should implement in their classrooms, it stresses the integration of the learning outcomes (skills) and the use of a thematic approach. The CAPS (Department of Basic Education, 2011b:14) refers to a "text-based, communicative and process-orientated" approach and the WCED CAPS training manual (Western Cape Education Department, 2012:36) guides FAL teachers to follow a "balanced language approach" (BLA) when teaching Afrikaans. Tompkins (1997: 25) argues that effective teachers using the BLA "scaffold or support learners" reading and writing. This approach is in line with Vygotsky's idea of the zone of proximal development (ZPD), where the learner is assisted in his or her development by a more knowledgeable adult, the teacher or peer.

The first additional language teacher

Nunan (1987) is convinced that in a FAL classroom, where the teacher has to adhere to the guidelines of communicative language teaching (CLT), it is the responsibility of FAL teachers to initiate communication through conscious interaction with their learners. The Minimum Requirements for Teacher Education Qualifications (Republic of South Africa, 2011) ascribes seven roles to the teacher: specialist in a phase, subject discipline or practice; learning mediator; interpreter and designer of learning programmes and materials; leader, administrator and manager; scholar, researcher and lifelong learner; assessor; and a community, citizenship and pastoral role. In addition to these roles, Shulman (1987: 8) identifies seven types of knowledge that should be part of the teacher's arsenal: knowledge of the subject content; knowledge of learners and their characteristics; general pedagogical knowledge; knowledge of curriculum; knowledge of educational ends, purposes and values; knowledge of the classroom environment; and knowledge of the practice of teaching, or pedagogical content knowledge (PCK). Bachman and Palmer (1996) further argue that the FAL teacher should also have some level of linguistic proficiency in the target language. They also argue that the focus should not only be on the linguistic accuracy, but that the communicative aspect should also be taken into account.

The first additional language learner

C2005, the RNCS (Department of Education, 2002) and CAPS (Department of Basic Education, 2011a) promote a shift from a teacher-centred approach to teaching and learning to a learner-centred approach. The teacher now has a new role as facilitator of learning and the learners become active participants in their own learning. In accordance with the theory of social constructivism, learners now have to take responsibility for their own learning, and become actively involved in knowledge construction with the guidance and support from the teacher and more knowledgeable peers. The social status of the target language in the community will also have an impact on the learners' motivation to learn the FAL. The learners' attitude toward the classroom situation, the target language and the teacher also have an impact on acquisition and learning. A positive attitude towards the above-mentioned elements will have a positive effect on language acquisition and learning (Van de Walt, 2004; Stern, 1992; Krashen, 1983).

Because learners have different learning styles and strategies (Nunan, 1995), they will approach classroom tasks differently. If the learner's learning style and strategy are accommodated in the classroom, it "can result in improved learner satisfaction and attainment" (Willing, 1988:1). It is important that teachers are aware of their learners' preferences with regard to learning styles and provide a variety of learning options and activities in the class which will allow learners the freedom to choose and practise their preferred way of learning. Teacher's knowledge about their learners' attitude towards the target language as well as knowledge about their learners' learning styles will inform teachers' perceptions about their methodologies in class.

7. Research Design

According to Creswell (2009:3), research designs are "plans and the procedures for research that span the decisions from broad assumptions to detailed methods of data collection and analysis". A mixed methods or multi-method research design was used, which allowed the researcher access to quantitative and qualitative data. Two different research instruments, namely questionnaires and semi-structured interviews, were implemented to collect data. This method provided the researchers with a better understanding of the research problem than either approach on its own would have allowed (Creswell & Clark, 20:5).

Quantitative data were collected by means of questionnaires which were completed by Afrikaans FAL teachers in Western Cape urban schools. The questionnaire consisted of 64 questions. The population was regarded as all the teachers teaching Afrikaans as FAL in Grade 4 – 6 classes in Western Cape urban schools. The sampling frame (a list of all the sampling units in the population) (Struwig & Stead, 2001) was changed to a list of all the urban primary schools in the Western Cape that offer Afrikaans FAL to make it more manageable. This list was obtained from the WCED. As this sampling frame consisted of more than 560 schools, the researchers decided to only select the schools on the list from the WCED that CPUT uses as practice teaching schools, which reduced the number of schools to 95. The Afrikaans FAL teachers at these schools would then form the sampling unit (those elements about which information is sought) (Struwig & Stead, 2001). In total 125 completed questionnaires were returned and the data were captured on an Excel spreadsheet. The captured data were then analysed by the Centre for Statistical Consultation at Stellenbosch University. For the purpose of summarising the results, frequency tables with the use of histograms and bar graphs were reported. Frequencies were reported as absolute numbers accompanied by percentages. The sampling for the qualitative strand of the research was done randomly from those schools and teachers who returned the completed questionnaires and indicated that they were willing to participate in the interviews. The names of all the schools that indicated on the questionnaires that they would be willing to be part of the interviewing process were placed in a box and 9 schools were randomly drawn from the box. The teachers from these schools who had completed the questionnaires were contacted telephonically to arrange the interviews at a time convenient to them. Eventually semi-structured group interviews were conducted with 17 Afrikaans FAL teachers at the 9 schools to collect the qualitative data that provided the researcher with in-depth information about the teachers' knowledge, skills and experiences (Turner, 2010:754). These quantitative data supported and elaborated the qualitative data gathered from conducting interviews and enabled corroboration of findings generated from the different data sets which assisted to cross check the findings of one method with another. In order for the qualitative data gathered from the interviews to be utilised to illuminate the data from the questionnaires, the interview questions were framed within the themes addressed in the questionnaires, namely teacher profile, language policy issues, learner profile, curriculum planning and delivery, teaching methodology, and availability and use of learning and teaching support material (LTSM). These interviews were recorded and then transcribed verbatim by an experienced transcriber.

7.1 Ethical Considerations

Before inviting schools to take part in the research, written consent for conducting research in WCED schools was obtained from the research department within the WCED. A letter was sent to the principals of the urban schools where Afrikaans is offered as FAL, inviting them to take part in the research and seeking their consent to conduct the research in their schools.

Each teacher was also fully informed about the research, including why and how they had been chosen to participate and only teachers who volunteered to complete the questionnaire and participate in the interviews were used. The participants were guaranteed that their questionnaires and interviews would be treated confidentially, their contributions and the information gained from the questionnaires and interviews would remain confidential and anonymous by referring to them under code names.

8. Results and Findings

The study focused on the research question: "What is the state of Afrikaans FAL teaching in the intermediate phase in Western Cape urban schools?" The data from the interviews and the questionnaires were used to corroborate, directly compare and relate the two sets of findings. The questionnaire analysis clearly revealed that English is the LoLT in the majority of schools that participated in the research and that Afrikaans is one of, or the only, FAL offered at these schools. The majority of learners at the participating schools are English mother-tongue speakers, who experience little exposure to the target language outside the FAL classroom. Both the questionnaire and the semi-structured interviews confirmed that the majority of the learners struggle most with reading comprehension, writing, grammar and to some extent listening, but they fare better at speaking and reading aloud in FAL.

In order to investigate the different elements of first additional language teaching, this research question was divided into three sub-questions. The evaluation of each of these sub-questions follows below.

8.1 How knowledgeable are the teachers about the national, provincial and school language policies and plans for Afrikaans FAL in the intermediate phase and to what extent are these policies being implemented at urban WCED schools?

In order to answer this research question the following questions were included in the questionnaire: How familiar are you with the official Language Policies of the Department of Basic Education and the WCED? Does your school have a language policy? In what ways do these policies influence your classroom practice? Is the school's language

policy aligned to the WCED's language Transformation Plan? How much participation or influence did teachers at the school have in the formulation of the current school language policy? How many hours of instruction per week are allocated to Afrikaans FAL for the intermediate phase?

In response to the question *How familiar are you with the official Language Policies of the Department of Basic Education and the WCED?* only 9% of the respondents indicated that they are very familiar with the official language policies of the DBE and a significant majority of 73% of the teachers rated themselves as fairly familiar with the DBE's language policies whereas 18% indicated that they are not at all familiar with the relevant policies. 10% of the respondents rated themselves as very familiar and 76% indicated that they are fairly familiar with the WCED's language policies. 14% of the respondents are not at all familiar with the language policies of the WCED. The responses from the teachers to the question on in what ways these policies influence their classroom practice were varied and sometimes irrelevant. Very few of the respondents showed any knowledge of the policies and did not indicate the relevance of these policies to their teaching of FAL in the classroom. From the following responses it is evident that the vast majority of the respondents confused the language policies of the DBE and WCED with the RNCS and the FAL curriculum:

"Influences timetables planning and assessment wrt LOs and AS."

"These policies only influence the formal assessments completed by the learners, in terms of both quantity and their quality."

"It gives guidelines as to what I teach to my learners."

It is evident from the questionnaires that the majority of schools (88%) do have a language policy, and 91% of these policies are aligned to the WCED Language Transformation Plan. 9% of the respondents did, however, no know whether their school's language policies were aligned to the Transformation Plan. 49% of the teachers indicated that teachers had a great deal of participation in the formulation of the current school language policy and 30% was of the opinion that teachers had only some participation in the process, whereas 6% of teachers stated that they had no participation. A total of 18% of the respondents did not know to what degree teachers had participated in the process.

According to the responses of the teachers, an average of 3 hours per week was allocated to Afrikaans FAL. The minimum number of hours allocated to Afrikaans FAL was recorded as one and a half hours per week. The CAPS (Department of Basic Education, 2011a) prescribes that 5 hours per week should be spent on the teaching of the FAL in grades 4-6.

Based on the research results of the questionnaires it may be inferred that although most of the schools do have language policies, the implementation may not be aligned with national and provincial requirements and that the teachers do not have an in-depth knowledge or understanding of the content of the specific national, provincial and school language policies.

Although the majority of teachers indicated in the questionnaire and during the interviews that these policies are implemented at their schools, they could not explain during the interviews how this is done. Most of the respondents confused the language policies with the RNCS as is evident from their responses during the interviews. When asked to what extent the language policies are implemented at their school during the interview, amongst the responses were the following two:

"We follow the guidelines. Our intermediate phase often meets to discuss suggestions and opinions and improvements."

"On assessment level. We comply with the number of assessments. Inclusive of learners' values and beliefs."

The majority of teachers are, however, in favour of the stipulation that all learners should study at least one additional language at school in order to promote multilingualism, although not all teachers think that Afrikaans should be that additional language. Based on the research results of the questionnaires and the interviews, it may be inferred that the schools do not implement the language policies exactly as stipulated. In many cases neither the teachers nor the parents participated in or influenced the formulation of the school's language policy as is prescribed in the South African Schools Act of 1996. In most schools Afrikaans as FAL is not introduced in Grade 1 as is required by C2005, the RNCS or the WCED Language Transformation Plan and there is no uniformity in the number of teaching hours per week allocated to Afrikaans FAL in the intermediate phase.

8.2 What is the level of training of FAL teachers in WCED urban schools and is it their perception that this training equipped them adequately to teach FAL in the intermediate phase?

The questionnaire included the following questions in order to answer the above question: In what year did you obtain your highest qualification? What is the highest level at which you studied Afrikaans in your post-school qualifications? Indicate the highest level at which you qualified in teaching of additional language (language methodology)? In what year did you obtain this qualification? Have you ever attended any in-service teacher training short courses that have been specific to the RNCS/CAPS for Afrikaans FAL?

Both sets of data confirmed that very few of these teachers have appropriate training in Afrikaans FAL teaching. The questionnaire data revealed that the majority of the teachers (77%) qualified before 1995 and therefore have not been exposed to the RNCS or CAPS in their formal training. 74% of respondents have been trained in the methodology of additional language teaching at diploma level and 10% of the teachers have FAL methodology at undergraduate level, which means for two or less years. None of the teachers has a postgraduate qualification in FAL teaching. According to

the questionnaire data the majority (64%) of the teachers have never attended any inservice teacher training short courses that have been specific to the RNCS or CAPs for Afrikaans FAL.

Although, according to the questionnaire, the teachers make use of a variety of teaching strategies, the interviews confirmed that they do not have much knowledge about appropriate FAL methodologies and FAL teaching and learning theories. According to the data gathered from both the questionnaires and interviews, certain activities and practices that are not in line with CLT and point to a more teacher-centred approach are still used in many of the classrooms, e.g. choral repetition, learning of vocabulary lists, over-emphasis of errors, translation activities and prepared orals. Teachers seem to have the perception that they do know enough about FAL teaching but the evidence points to the fact that they are not well versed in new approaches and methodologies pertaining to FAL teaching. Although teachers may have had many years of experience in teaching Afrikaans FAL, both sets of data highlight the lack of support and guidance from the WCED with regard to in-service training and workshops on new developments in FAL teaching, specifically aimed at Afrikaans as FAL. Hence teachers found the curriculum was too challenging and congested. From the interview data it is evident that teachers locate the blame for their lack of training and knowledge outside of themselves, e.g. the WCED, as their responses to the following interview question revealed: What form of in-service training does the WCED provide with regard to the teaching of Afrikaans FAL?

- OP: "If you're asking me I think it's extremely neglected. I will go as far as to say that it's non-existent, to tell you the truth, to be quite honest."
- OK: "Ek kan nie onthou dat ek al in die afgelope paar jaar gehoor het dat daar word opleiding aangebied vir Afrikaans nie." [I cannot remember that in the past couple of years I've heard of training being offered for Afrikaans.]
- OD: "In the 20 odd years that I've been teaching we've never had support ... never had support or anything extra to work with, anything new or bright or breezy, nothing, nothing like that has come along hey".
- 8.3 What are teachers' perceptions about their methodologies and the use of resources to teach FAL effectively?

The questionnaire focused on the following questions: How important do you consider listening with understanding, speaking fluently, reading and viewing, writing accurately and grammar to be for effective language teaching and learning in the classroom? How often do you use the mother tongue of learners or the LoLT for explanations in the FAL class? How often do you explain in Afrikaans? Are the textbooks used generally appropriate for your classes? Do you ever use electronic or audio-visual material for teaching FAL? Do you experience a shortage of any of the following teaching resources for the FAL?

A significant majority (76%) of respondents regarded listening with understanding as very important for effective FAL teaching and learning in the classroom. Only 29% of the teachers regarded speaking fluently as very important for effective FAL teaching and learning whereas the greater majority (64%) or respondents considered oral fluency as important but not very important. There was no clear distinction between the number of teachers who regard reading and viewing as important and very important. 47% indicated that reading and viewing are important, whereas slightly more teachers (53%) regard reading and viewing as very important for effective teaching and learning of the FAL. Writing accurately is considered as important for effective teaching and learning of the FAL by 59% of the respondents. 96% of the teachers regard grammar as either very important or important for effective teaching and learning the FAL.

Most of the teachers (46%) use another language, either HL or LoLT, regularly for explanations in the Afrikaans FAL classroom and the same percentage of respondents regularly explains in Afrikaans. Another 24% indicate that they sometimes use Afrikaans for explanations. The majority (82%) of teachers are of the opinion that the textbooks used are generally appropriate for their learners, but a large 60% of respondents indicated that they do not use electronic or audio-visual material for teaching Afrikaans as FAL. One of the reasons for this response may be because 72% of teachers indicated that they experience a shortage of audio-visual and electronic material in the Afrikaans FAL classroom.

Both sets of data also revealed that these Afrikaans FAL teachers experience a dire need for age- and language-level-appropriate teaching and learning materials. Not all learners have their own textbooks to work from, although this is the resource most used as LTSM by the teachers. Many teachers also rely on their own material, e.g. work sheets, which they have developed over the years. Little use is made of authentic texts such as newspaper and magazine articles and advertisements. The data also indicate the teachers' frustration at the lack of Afrikaans readers that are pitched at their learners' different levels of proficiency in the target language. Sixty percent of the respondents indicated that they do not use computers or audio-visual materials in their FAL classrooms. This corresponds with the findings from the literature study that a variety of materials should be used in the language classroom. This can most likely be ascribed to the following reasons: the teachers have never been trained how to incorporate these materials and media into their teaching; the schools have insufficient electronic and audio-visual media available; or there is a shortage of appropriate electronic and audio-visual material available in Afrikaans. It has also been confirmed by the interviews as the following responses to the question indicate: "To what extent do you make use of audio-visual and electronic media in your teaching of Afrikaans?

OM: "Ons het niks in Afrikaans nie". ["We have nothing in Afrikaans."]

OD: "No electronic programmes. Not for Afrikaans".

OO: "... we having a big problem with our computer room, our server is down".

9. Limitations of the study

During this study the researcher experienced the following limitations:

- Research on the teaching of first additional languages (second languages) is plentiful, but the focus is usually on English as first additional language, both locally and internationally. There is a very limited pool of research on Afrikaans First Additional Language teaching in South African primary schools the researcher could draw on.
- 2. There are many urban schools in the Western Cape where the home language of the majority of learners is Afrikaans and isiXhosa. These schools have not been involved in this research because Afrikaans is not offered as FAL at these schools. The results and findings are therefore only valid within the research parameters of this study and not applicable to the teaching of all first additional languages in Western Cape urban schools.
- 3. The data-collection phase of this study was undertaken during the time when the RNCS was still the national curriculum in the intermediate phase. Since 2013 a new curriculum, CAPS, has been introduced in all intermediate phase class-rooms. Although reference is made to RNCS-specific elements such as learning areas, learning outcomes and assessment standards, the fundamental challenges in Afrikaans FAL teaching are still the same and need to be addressed.

10. Recommendations

Based on the findings of the study the following recommendations are made.

1. Training of pre-service teachers

It is of the utmost importance that the initial training of teachers be upgraded and adapted to keep up with the latest developments in the field of first additional language teaching, especially Afrikaans, and an interactive approach to language teaching. Initial teacher training programmes at HEIs should also focus on the development of student-teachers' Afrikaans proficiency.

2. In-service training and support from the WCED

Qualified teachers must have a thorough knowledge of the curriculum, subject content and language teaching methodologies (Shulman, 1987). The WCED should revisit its in-service training programmes and consider backing up its initial curriculum training programmes (especially for Afrikaans FAL) with sustained and continuous follow-up training sessions to all in-service teachers in the intermediate phase. The in-service training should also be expanded to introduce FAL teachers to the latest developments in FAL methodologies and teaching and learning strategies. One of the major challenges for teachers is the learners' negative attitude towards Afrikaans. It is important that the

WCED assist the teachers in developing strategies to address this challenge in the classroom. The promotion of Afrikaans as one of the official languages of the Western Cape should therefore be an explicit priority for the WCED. The department should ensure that only teachers who are proficient in the target language, Afrikaans, are expected to teach Afrikaans as FAL. Confident teachers who speak the target language fluently and display a positive attitude towards the language they teach will contribute towards a more positive classroom atmosphere that is conducive to the acquisition of a new language (Nel & Müller, 2010).

3. Implementation of language-in-education policies and the national curriculum

It is recommended that school management teams and departmental officials ensure that the national and provincial language-in-education policies and the national curriculum requirements regarding the teaching of FAL are adhered to. School governing bodies should determine the schools' language policies and the parent bodies should be involved in these decisions. Learners in the primary schools should be introduced to the first additional language from Grade 1 in order for them to be able to perform at the expected levels in the intermediate phase. The WCED should monitor the implementation of these policies and the curriculum in the schools carefully. Although there is agreement among the participants that all learners should be exposed to a first additional language, it is recommended that the WCED, the school management teams and the school governing bodies find a solution to the situation where indigenous and other foreign language mother-tongue speakers are forced to take Afrikaans as FAL when it actually is their Second Additional Language (SAL) or even a foreign language.

4. Provision of LTSM

According to the participants the reported shortage of appropriate Afrikaans FAL LTSM has a negative impact on teaching and learning in the classroom. It is recommended that the WCED provides additional age- and language-level-appropriate Afrikaans resources to primary schools where Afrikaans is the FAL. These resources should include audiovisual materials, computers including Afrikaans computer programs which can be used in computer-assisted language teaching and learning. Teachers also need to be trained in how to use and integrate these electronic teaching aids into their language teaching.

5. Curriculum adjustments

The literature has shown that when the curriculum is too challenging and congested, teachers choose what they teach based on their own preferences and subject knowledge. The majority of learners do not achieve the expected levels of competence in the target language as set out in the curriculum. The expected outcomes for Afrikaans FAL and English FAL are the same (Department of Basic Education, 2011a & 2011b), although the purpose of teaching the two languages differs. The DBE should revisit the expected levels of competence for each grade for Afrikaans FAL and put forward more realistic and achievable expectations.

11. Contribution of this Study

This study contributes to the current knowledge on the teaching of additional languages in South Africa. In this case the teaching of Afrikaans as First Additional Language in the intermediate phase is investigated and the findings of this study highlight the challenges Afrikaans FAL teachers are confronted with on a daily basis. With the national emphasis on English as First Additional Language (Department of Basic Education, 2011:11), much research has been conducted in this area, but very little data are available on the teaching of Afrikaans FAL in the 564 Western Cape urban primary schools. In many of these schools the learners have no option but to choose Afrikaans as FAL, although it is their Second Additional Language or even a foreign language. This is even more reason why the teachers of Afrikaans FAL should be well trained and equipped to face this challenging task.

The information gathered on the current state of the teaching of Afrikaans FAL in intermediate phase classes in Western Cape urban schools will inform the Western Cape Education Department of the state of affairs with regards to First Additional language teaching. It is evident from the results that there is very little interaction between the department and the teachers regarding Afrikaans FAL teaching. This knowledge may encourage the WCED to design and implement effective in-service training programmes for Afrikaans FAL teachers and monitor the implementation of the training in the classroom. Another outcome of this study may also be an equal distribution of resources for the effective teaching of all three official languages in Western Cape primary schools.

HEIs that are responsible for the training of pre-service teachers will be able to focus on the current challenges in the classroom, as identified in this study, and adapt or re-design their modules on Afrikaans FAL teaching in order to prepare the new teachers to manage these challenges effectively.

This study has highlighted the fact that the majority of the schools fail to implement the national and provincial language policies and curricula with regard to Afrikaans FAL as intended. A report on the findings of this study will be made available to the WCED, which may result in the department providing stronger guidance and support to schools in the implementation of the current policies.

12. Concluding remarks

The relevance of this study lies in the national drive towards the promotion of multilingualism among the general population, and especially in education (Republic of South Africa 1996a). The researcher followed a mixed methods approach (questionnaires and semi-structured interviews), supported by a theoretical framework for language teaching and learning, a literature study pertaining to first additional language teaching and an analysis of FAL curricula. Constructivism and social constructivism were identified as the underpinning theories for language teaching and learning. The literature study provided an overview of

all the major methodologies relevant to FAL teaching. The study concluded that there is no single method or approach that will ensure effective FAL teaching, but that an eclectic approach will deliver the best results (Department of Basic Education, 2011b).

Teachers are caught up in traditional language teaching methods and strategies, which do not contribute to the development of learners' performance in the target language. A new method or approach is needed. According to the latest research in the field (Le Cordeur, 2010) and the new school curriculum (Department of Basic Education, 2011b), teachers should follow an integrated, communicative and text-based approach to FAL teaching. The WCED expects teachers to implement a balanced language approach, where the focus is on the teaching of reading, while integrating the other communicative skills, using scaffolding strategies (Western Cape Education Department, 2006). It is therefore the responsibility of the HEIs and the WCED to ensure that initial teacher training programmes and in-service training workshops prepare the teachers adequately to implement the prescribed curriculum using appropriate methodologies and strategies.

The study also closely examined the different types of knowledge that a language teacher should have. The literature indicates that the teacher should have a thorough knowledge of the curriculum, the subject content, teaching and learning theories, the methodologies of teaching the subject (PCK) and that the language teacher should also be fairly proficient in the target language. It was disconcerting to find that the teachers' knowledge of the curriculum, language policies and methodologies is extremely limited. The expectation is that the situation will not be much different in other schools.

Furthermore, the study looked at the use of appropriate and relevant LTSM in the FAL classroom. It was found that most teachers still mainly use the textbook as teaching resource and that they experience a great shortage of appropriate Afrikaans LTSM. The expectation is that, in the present age of technology, learners' interest will be stimulated through the use of technological teaching aids. Teachers should therefore have access to and use a variety of media and technological teaching aids and be capable of integrating them effectively into their language teaching. The WCED should also ensure that sufficient and appropriate LTSM are available to teachers and that the teachers are trained to use these materials in their teaching.

It became evident from the data that many learners and parents have a negative attitude towards Afrikaans. Teachers indicated during the interviews that they are not equipped with teaching strategies and techniques to manage these negative attitudes. The results from the questionnaires as well as the interviews show that many teachers still follow a teacher-centred approach to teaching, which is an indication that learners are not given enough opportunities to develop their communicative competence through interaction with others.

This study does not offer a quick-fix solution to the problems in the Afrikaans FAL classroom, but the researchers believe that the findings will highlight the daily challenges that Afrikaans FAL teachers have to face and that all role players will need to become actively involved in improving the state of Afrikaans FAL teaching in the Western Cape.

References

- Babbie, E. 2009. *The Practice of Social Research*. Wadsworth, London: Cengage Learning.
- Bachman, L. F. & Palmer, A. S. 1996. *Language Testing in Practice*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Bamgbose, A. 1991. Language and the Nation: The Language Question in Sub-Saharan Africa. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Canale, M. & Swain, M. 1980. Theoretical bases of communicative approaches to second language teaching and testing. *Applied Linguistics* 11: 1-47.
- Cape Peninsula University of Technology. 2010. Results of Afrikaans proficiency test for first year students.
- Cele, N. 2004. 'Equity of access' and 'Equity of outcomes' challenged by language policy, politics and practice in South African higher education: The myth of language equality in education. South African Journal of Higher Education 18(1): 38-56.
- Chapelle, C. A. 2010. Computer-assisted Language Learning. In: Kaplan, R. B. (Ed). 2010. *The Oxford Handbook of Applied Linguistics*. 2nd Edition. New York: Oxford University Press. pp. 539 547.
- Creswell, J.W. 2009. Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative and mixed Methods Approaches. 3rd Edition. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Creswell, J.W. & Plano Clark, V. L. 2011. *Designing and Conducing Mixed Methods Research*. 2nd Edition. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Curzon, L. B. 1985. *Teaching in Further Education. An outline of principles and practice.*3rd Edition. London: Cassell.
- Department of Basic Education (DBE). 2011a. Nasionale Kurrikulumverklaring (NKV), Kurrikulum- en Assesseringsbedleidsverklaring, Intermediêre fase Graad 4 –6, Afrikaans Eerste Addisionele Taal. Pretoria: Government Printer.
- Department of Basic Education (DBE). 2011b. National Curriculum Statement (NCS), National Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS), Foundation Phase, Grades 1– 3, English First Additional Language. Pretoria: Government Printer.
- Department of Education (DoE). 1997a. Language-in-Education policy. Pretoria: Government Printer.

- Department of Education (DoE). 2002. Hersiene Nasionale Kurrikulumverklaring Graad R–9 (Skole) Beleid, Tale, Afrikaans Eerste Addisionele Taal. Pretoria: Government Printer.
- Department of Education (DoE). 2008. Foundations for Learning: Intermediate Phase Language Lesson plans Grade 6. Pretoria: Government Printer.
- Department of Education (DoE). 2009. Report of the Task Team for the Review of the Implementation of the National Curriculum Statement. Final Report. Pretoria: Government Printer.
- De Varennes, F. 2010. Language rights in South Africa: All are equal, but some are more equal than others? Paper presented at a symposium of the Faculty of Law, University of Pretoria, Pretoria, 10 February.
- Donato, R. 1994. Collective Scaffolding in Second Language Learning. In: Lantolf, J.P. and Appel, G. (Eds). 1994. *Vygotskian Approaches to Second Language Research*. New Jersey: Ablex Publishing Company. pp. 33-56.
- Fishman, J. 1976. Bilingual education: What and why. In: Alatis, J. E. & Twaddell, K. (Eds). 1976. *English as a second language in bilingual education*. Washington, DC: TESOL. pp. XX.
- Harley, K. & Wedekind, V. 2004. Political change, curriculum change and social formation, 1990 2002. In: Chisholm, L. (Ed). 2004. *Changing Class: Education and social change in post-apartheid South Africa*. London: Zed Books. pp. 195-220.
- Heugh, K. & T. Skutnabb-Kangas (Eds). 2010. *Multilingual education works: from the periphery to the centre*. Delhi: Orient Blackswan.
- Howie, S., Venter, E., Van Staden, S., Zimmerman, L., Long, C., Du Toit, C., Sherman, V. & Archer, E. 2008. *PIRLS 2006: Summary Report. South African children's reading literacy achievement.* Pretoria: University of Pretoria.
- Jenkins, D.R. & Shipman, M.D. 1976. *Curriculum, an introduction*. London: Open Books Publishing Limited.
- Johnson, K. 1994. Communicative approaches and communicative processes. In: Brumfit, C. J. and Johnson, K. (Eds). 1994. *The Communicative Approach to Language Teaching*. Oxford: Oxford University Press. pp. 167-182.
- Kelly, A.V. 1983. The Curriculum. Theory and practice. London: Paul Chapman.
- Kern, R. 2006. Perspectives on technology in learning and teaching languages. *TESOL Quarterly* 40(1): 183–210.

- Krashen, S.D. 1983. *Principles and Practice in Second Language Acquisition*. Oxford: Pergamon.
- Kvale, S. 1996. *Interviews: an Introduction to Qualitative Research Interviewing*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Lantolf, J.P. & Thorne, S.L. 2006. Sociocultural Theory and Second Language Learning. In: Van Patten, B. & Williams, J. (Eds). *Theories in second language acquisition*. Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum. pp. 197-220.
- Larsen-Freeman, D. & Anderson, M. 2011. *Techniques & Principles in Language Teaching*. 3rd Edition. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Le Cordeur, M. 2010. The interactive approach to reading instruction: an alternative to traditional ways of teaching reading. *Journal of Humanities* 50(1): 104-118.
- Le Cordeur, M. 2011. Mother-tongue-based bilingual education: a possible solution to South Africa's literacy and numeracy problems. *Litnet Akademies* 8(3): 434-460.
- Le Cordeur, M.L.A. & Basson, M. 2014. Effektiewe ondersteuning aan die Xhosamoedertaalsprekers in Afrikaansmediumklasse. Effective support to Xhosa mothertongue speakers in Afrikaans-medium classes. *Per Linguam 30(1):109-127.*
- McLaughlin, M. 1998. Listening and Learning from the Field: Tales of Policy Implementation and Situated Practice. In: Hargreaves, A., Lieberman, A., Fullan, A. & Hopkins, D. (Eds). *International Handbook of Educational Change*. Great Britain: Kluwer Academic. pp. 70-84.
- Nel, N. & Müller, H. 2010. The impact of teachers' limited English proficiency on English second language learners in South African schools. *South African Journal of Education* 30: 635–650.
- Nunan, D. 1995. Language Teaching Methodology: A textbook for teachers. Hertfordshire: Phoenix ELT.
- Republic of South Africa. 1996a. *Constitution of the Republic of South Africa Act 108 of 1996*. Pretoria: Government Printer.
- Republic of South Africa. 1996b. *National Education Policy Act 27 of 1996.* Pretoria: Government Printer.
- Republic of South Africa. 1996c. *South African Schools Act 84 of 1996*. Pretoria: Government Printer.
- Shulman, L.S. 1987. Knowledge and teaching: Foundations of a new reform. *Harvard Educational Review* 57(1): 1–22.

- Stern, H. 1992. Issues and Options in Language Teaching. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Thornhill, C.. 2014. First additional language teaching in selected grade 4 6 classes in Western Cape urban schools: The case of Afrikaans. Unpublished doctoral dissertation. Stellenbosch: University of Stellenbosch.
- Tompkins, G.E. 1997. *Literacy for the 21st century: a balanced approach*. Upper Saddle River, N.J.: Merrill.
- Turner, D.W. 2010. Qualitative interview design: a practical guide for novice investigators. *The Qualitative Report* 15(4): 754–760.
- Unterhalter, E. 2003. The capabilities approach and gendered education: An examination of South African complexities. *Theory and Research in Education* 1(3): 7-22.
- Van der Wal, R.J. 2004. Developing Proficiency in Afrikaans as an Additional Language. Unpublished doctoral dissertation. Pretoria: University of Pretoria.
- Van der Walt, C. 2009. The functions of code switching in English language learning classes. *Per linguam* 25(1): 30-43.
- Vygotsky, L.S. 1962. Thought and Language. Cambridge, MA: M.I.T. Press.
- Vygotsky, L.S. 1978. *Mind in society: The development of higher psychological processes*. Cambridge, MS: Harvard University Press.
- Western Cape Education Department (WCED). 2006. *WCED Literacy and Numeracy Strategy 2006 2016*. Cape Town: Government Printer.
- Western Cape Education Department (WCED). 2007a. WCED Language
 Transformation Plan promotes six years of mother-tongue-based bilingual
 education and conversational trilingualism. Media release. Cape Town. http://
 wced.school.za/comms/press/2007/81_language.html. Date of access:
 12 December 2010.
- Western Cape Education Department (WCED). 2012. *National curriculum Statement* (NCS) Grades R 12 Teacher Orientation Manual Intermediate Phase Grades 4 6. Cape Town: Government Printer.
- Western Cape Province (WCP). 1997. Western Cape Provincial School Education Act no 12 of 1997. Cape Town: Government Printer.
- Western Cape Province (WCP). 1998. Western Cape Provincial Languages Act no 13 of 1998. Cape Town: Government Printer.

Wheeler, D.K. 1967. *Curriculum process*. London: University of London Press.

Williams, M. & Burden, R.L. 1997. *Psychology for Language Teachers: A social constructivist approach*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Willing, K. 1988. Learning Strategies in Adult Migrant Education. Adelaide: NCRC.

Wright, T. 1987. Roles of Teachers and Learners. Oxford: Oxford University.

ABOUT THE AUTHORS

Christa Thornhill

Faculty of Education, Cape Peninsula University of Technology, P.O. Box 13881, 7705 Mowbray

Email address: thornhillc@cput.ac.za

Christa Thornhill is the Assistant Dean of the Faculty of Education at the Cape Peninsula University of Technology. Her fields of interest are First Additional Language teaching and FAL methodology. She received her doctorate in 2014 from Stellenbosch University and the focus of her research was the teaching of Afrikaans as FAL in intermediate phase classes in urban schools in the Cape Town area. She co-authored two books: one on First Additional Language teaching in the Foundation Phase and one focusing on minority languages of the world.

Michael le Cordeur

Department of Curriculum studies. Faculty of Education Stellenbosch University, Matieland, 7602 Stellenbosch

Email address: mlecorde@sun.ac.za

Michael le Cordeur is a Chancellor's Award Winner and Head of the Department of Curriculum Studies at Stellenbosch University where he is teaching Afrikaans Education. He obtained a doctorate at Stellenbosch University (2004) and also holds degrees from the Universities of South Africa (UNISA) and the Western Cape (UWC). He is the author of various textbooks, accredited articles and has given numerous papers internationally and nationally. Amongst others he co-authored a textbook for HL and FAL teachers in the Intermediate Phase. His research focuses on reading and writing, language policies and language and identity.

Tydskrif vir Taalonderrig - Journal for Language Teaching - Ijenali yokuFundisa iLimi - IJenali yokuFundisa iiLwimi -Ibhuku Lokufundisa Ulimi - Tšenale ya tša Go ruta Polelo - Buka ya Thuto ya Puo - Jenale ya Thuto ya Dipuo - Ijenali Yekufundzisa Lulwimi - Jena?a va u Gudisa Nvambo - Jenala yo Dyondzisa Ririmi - Tydskrif vir Taalonderrig -Journal for Language Teaching - Ijenali yokuFundisa iLimi - IJenali yokuFundisa iiLwimi - Ibhuku Lokufundisa Ulimi - Tšenale ya tša Go ruta Polelo - Buka ya Thuto ya Puo -Jenale ya Thuto ya Dipuo - Ijenali Yekufundzisa Lulwimi - Jena?a ya u Gudisa Nyambo - Jenala yo Dyondzisa Ririmi - Tydskrif vir Taalonderrig - Journal for Language Teaching - Ijenali yokuFundisa iLimi - IJenali yokuFundisa iiLwimi - Ibhuku Lokufundisa Ulimi - Tšenale ya tša Go ruta Polelo - Buka ya Thuto ya Puo - Jenale ya Thuto ya Dipuo -Ijenali Yekufundzisa Lulwimi - Jena?a ya u Gudisa Nyambo - Jenala yo Dyondzisa Ririmi - Tydskrif vir Taalonderrig - Journal for Language Teaching - Ijenali yokuFundisa iLimi -IJenali vokuFundisa iiLwimi - Ibhuku Lokufundisa Ulimi - Tšenale ya tša Go ruta Polelo -Buka ya Thuto ya Puo - Jenale ya Thuto ya Dipuo - Ijenali Yekufundzisa Lulwimi - Jena?a ya u Gudisa Nyambo - Jenala Dyondzisa Ririmi - Tydskrif vir Taalonderrig - Journal for Language Teaching - Ijenali yokuFundisa iLimi - IJenali yokuFundisa iiLwimi -Ibhuku Lokufundisa Ulimi - Tšenale ya tša Go ruta Polelo - Buka ya Thuto ya Puo - Jenale ya Thuto ya Dipuo - Ijenali Yekufundzisa Lulwimi - Jena?a ya u Gudisa Nyambo - Jenala yo Dyondzisa Ririmi - Tydskrif vir Taalonderrig - Journal for Language Teaching - Ijenali yokuFundisa iLimi - IJenali yokuFundisa iiLwimi - Ibhuku Lokufundisa Ulimi -Tšenale ya tša Go ruta Polelo - Buka ya Thuto ya Puo -Jenale ya Thuto ya Dipuo - Ijenali Yekufundzisa Lulwimi - Jena?a ya u Gudisa Nyambo - Jenala yo Dyondzisa Ririmi - Tydskrif vir Taalonderrig - Journal for Language Teaching - Ijenali yokuFundisa iLimi - IJenali yokuFundisa iiLwimi - Ibhuku Lokufundisa Ulimi - Tšenale ya tša Go ruta Polelo - Buka ya Thuto ya Puo - Jenale ya Thuto ya Dipuo -Ijenali Yekufundzisa Lulwimi - Jena?a ya u Gudisa Nyambo - Jenala yo Dyondzisa Ririmi - Tydskrif vir Taalonderrig -Journal for Language Teaching - Ijenali yokuFundisa iLimi - IJenali yokuFundisa iiLwimi - Ibhuku Lokufundisa Ulimi - Tšenale ya tša Go ruta Polelo - Buka ya Thuto ya Puo -Jenale ya Thuto ya Dipuo - Ijenali Yekufundzisa Lulwimi - Jena?a ya u Gudisa Nyambo - Jenala yo Dyondzisa Ririmi - - Tydskrif vir Taalonderrig - Journal for Language Teaching - Ijenali yokuFundisa iLimi - IJenali yokuFundisa iiLwimi - Ibhuku Lokufundisa Ulimi - Tšenale ya tša Go ruta