Capital accumulation, social reproduction and social struggle: rethinking the function of spatial planning and land use

Paul Hendler
School of Public Management
Stellenbosch University
Email: paulhendler@insite.co.za

Abstract

This purpose of this paper is to understand the historical impact on urban land usage of ecological, economic and political factors in order to conceptualise strategic ideas for transforming urban land usage currently and in the future to enable social equity, promote the efficient use of resources and sustain the ecologies within which cities and towns are embedded. The paper analyses the historical data through a triangular matrix of capital accumulation, state reproduction and planning strategies and popular movements pressurizing to benefit from demanded land usages. Capital accumulation is viewed as a process through which wealth produced by labour accrues both to owners of capital and managers in the form of unearned value. This insight is particularly important in the current phase of global capitalism, in which financialisation is a dominant form of economic activity and impacts also on the way spaces are planned and used in urban areas for economic gain. Given the contradiction between an exponentially growing economy and finite resources, I take into account limits to growth and incorporate ecological economics’ insights into classical political economy analyses.

Key words: spatial planning, land use, capital accumulation, social reproduction, ecology

Résumé

Ce but de cet article est de comprendre l’impact historique sur l’utilisation des terres urbaines de facteurs écologiques, économiques et politiques afin de conceptualiser des idées stratégiques pour transformer l’utilisation des terres urbaines actuellement et dans l’avenir pour permettre l’équité sociale, promouvoir l’utilisation efficace des ressources et soutenir les écologies dans lequel villes et villages sont intégrés. Le document analyse les données historiques à travers une matrice triangulaire de l’accumulation du capital, la reproduction de l’État et des stratégies de planification et de mouvements populaires de pressurisation de bénéficier des usages des terres réclamées. L’accumulation de capital est considérée comme un processus par lequel la richesse produite par le travail revient à la fois pour les propriétaires et les gestionnaires de capitaux sous la forme de la valeur non acquises. Cette idée est particulièrement important dans la phase actuelle du capitalisme mondial, dans lequel la financierisation est une forme dominante de

Introduction

The status of the spatial planning profession strongly influences the planning of land usage in our cities: the Spatial Planning and Land Use Management Act (SPLUMA) (RSA 16/2013) requires municipalities to develop Spatial Development Frameworks (SDFs) that define where and for what purpose land will be developed. Linked to the SDFs is ‘spatial targeting’, the idea that public investments in infrastructure in specific identified spaces will ‘crowd in’ household settlement, and private investment will follow, which ascribes to spatial planning the power to bring about access for citizens to services, facilities, employment and livelihood opportunities. Too often spatial planners assumes that bad outcomes are simply a reflection of problematic planning, but planning and planners do not stand above society and its network of conflicting political and economic interests. The options of how land is to be used are limited by factors external to planning: macro-economic trends that reinforce jobless growth as well as the need to maximise resource efficiency and conserve an increasingly threatened ecology (Department of Environmental Affairs, 2011: 10). Planning as a disciplined technique functions within a larger context where the influence of political and economic factors often undermines the best intentions of planners. This paper rethinks the current dominant technicist assumptions about the role of planning and its impact on space and land usage in order to lay a political economy basis for understanding historical spatial planning and urban land use strategies, and for proposing political and economic approaches to address spatial marginalisation and economic disempowerment of the majority of citizens in our cities.

Rethinking these phenomena requires understanding the political-economy of spatial planning and urban land usage, a different conceptual starting point to the current dominant neo-liberal way of seeing urban economic development, which confines itself to describing verifiable facts and eschews searching for theories to explain the underlying causes of phenomena.

1 Santayana (1998: 284)
Spatial reproduction, capital accumulation and social struggle

To analyse economic and political structures as outcomes of the practices of historical agents, rather than as essential givens, requires specific concepts of what constitutes the economic and the political and their interrelationship. ‘Facts’ about the economy and the state are socially constructed through asymmetrical power relations between classes, genders, and ethnic and other social groups (Anthonissen, 2015: 5). These social relations of domination-subordination made settler colonialists dominant vis-à-vis indigenous people (Terreblanche, 2005: 6) and underlie the creation and reproduction of urban land use patterns.

Spatial planning and land usage forms are the outcomes past social struggles where grassroots actors and planning officials organised and formulated different narratives and exerted differential power. Knowing this history (Anthonissen, 2015: 5) and imagining a utopia, unencumbered by present-day restrictions (Turner, 1978: 11) can help understand how to reconstruct policies, and economic and spatial structures to enable employment in clean manufacturing located within sustainable socially equitable cities.

These struggles were framed by the interests underlying processes of capital accumulation, articulated with state social reproduction policies and practices. The following is a graphic representation of the theoretical framework for understanding the historically changing spatial policies and land use management practices.

```
Accumulation

Spatial planning policies and land use management regulations

Social struggle - grassroots

State reproductive policies
```

A key link between state policies and the economy is reproduction of labour power, i.e. the rejuvenation of the physical and mental abilities of people, in order for them to work (Althusser, 1970: 125-128). Reproduction of labour power for mining, manufacturing and agricultural capital happened through the statutory accommodation of workers in defined spaces and under specific circumstances. Based on Hendler (1986; 2015a; 2015b) urban land use is analysed historically in terms of a periodisation of state policies, capital accumulation and social struggles. The purpose is to demonstrate the interdependence and interlinking of the state, capital accumulation and social struggles in the construction of urban land usages in South Africa (Hendler, 2010: 245-268; Poulantzas, 2000).

Financialisation and neo-liberalism

A key developmental challenge facing all our cities is the high levels of unemployment and the stark separation of living places (dormitories) from working places. The neoliberal ideology regards the economy as a process where rational individuals compete for scarce resources, and which regulates itself and is therefore best left alone. However, to restructure economic processes and the spaces where they are practised, for job-intensive and green manufacturing, requires that we first understand how western capitalist economies were actually restructured since the late-1980s and 1990s, primarily through investment banking in a process that has been described as financialisation. Key characteristics were the expansion (and proliferation of types) of financial assets relative to real activity, absolute and relative expansion of speculative as opposed to or at the expense of real investment, a shift in the balance of productive to financial imperatives within the private sector, increasing income inequality arising out of financial rewards, consumer-led credit-based booms, penetration of finance into pensions, education, health, and provision of economic and social infrastructure, emergence of a neo-liberal culture of reliance upon markets and private capital and corresponding anti-statism (Ashman et al, 2011: 174-176). One of the impacts of financialisation is deindustrialisation and therefore the loss of productive work opportunities. In contrast the political–economy framework enables us to see socio-political and macro-economic limitations (particularly the unsustainability of credit bubbles) to the progressive realisation of the ‘right to the city’5, rather than simply facilitating the privatisation and financialisation of the economy, which is often the economic usage to which re-planned and reconstructed urban land is put in these times.

---

2 Accumulation refers to a cycle of processes where money capital is invested in labour power and materials to produce new commodities, which are then exchanged for money – in this process the owners of capital are driven to maximise profits and workers to maximise wages.

3 Social reproduction refers to processes like the provision of policing, education, housing, transportation as well as ideological discourses that give meaning to societies, where the state has performed – and continues to perform – historical functions, although social reproduction functions also extend beyond the state to maintain social relations of production.

4 Indications are a $681 trillion global derivatives market, i.e. more than 10 times the value of underlying global GDP of $66 trillion (Hodgson-Brown, 2010: 192). In South Africa over 150% growth in the construction, finance and trade sectors and just 13% in manufacturing (2000 and 2008) (Bond, 2010: 21), illegal capital flight, exceeding 20% of GDP (2007) and the unh unbankability of 40% of the population (2013) (Fitz, n.d.2.3).

5 Jobless growth’ also characterised the GDPs of Nelson Mandela Bay and Mangaung Metropolitan Municipalities (2010) (anecdotal evidence arising from consultancy work for these cities).

5 The ‘right to the city’ is an idea and slogan that was first proposed by Lefebvre (1968)
Ecological economics

The global growth economic model is unsustainable (Swilling 2010: 11). Both neoliberal ideology and classical political economy fail to consider the ‘natural’ limits to the supply of resource inputs to economic processes as well as the limited capacity of natural sinks to process the waste outputs from economic processes. Exponential economic and population growth places continuously increasing demand on limited planetary raw materials and resources; at the same time continuously expanding industrial waste is starting to overwhelm the finite ability of the earth’s ecology to degrade noxious waste into benign components and to recycle these in the biosphere. Two stark examples of the limits to growth are the peaking of oil production and the inability of the earth’s ecological systems to sufficiently sequester carbon from atmospheric carbon dioxide. The underlying depletion of oil supply is reflected in the trend rise in as well volatility of oil prices; oil price changes have a knock on effect on prices throughout the global economy because oil-derived products and by-products form part of all the materials in the production of commodities (Rubin, 2009). Global warming from greenhouse gas emissions reflects the inability of ecosystems to sequester the carbon being spewed into the atmosphere. Globally, 40 per cent of energy use, 17 per cent of fresh water use, 25 per cent of wood harvested and 40 per cent of material use is attributed to the built environment (US Green Building Council, 2008), a direct link between urban land usage, carbon emissions and the ability of ecosystems to sequester carbon dioxide. To incorporate ecological and resource limits it is necessary to adopt the insights of ecological economics (Swilling, n.d. 28), the spatial implication of which is localisation of production and food supply, and densification and compactness of urban form due to the imperative to use resources more efficiently in the transition from non-renewable resources to renewable resources. For example, as oil starts becoming too expensive to sustain production and distribution of affordable food we will need to set aside more local spaces for organic urban agriculture. Similarly, as oil-based road motor transport becomes economically unsustainable, we will have to make the transition to electrified rail public transport and the overall land use management systems of our cities will have to be adjusted to include the requisite public transportation infrastructure.

In the history of urban land development in South Africa, agencies representing different class and ethnic interests contested where urban land should be developed and who (i.e. government, private industry or the people) should pay for these developments. The history of the planning of urban space and the management of the usage of land in these spaces has been periodised to reflect some of the key social reproduction interventions and their related economic accumulation rhythms.

The symbiotic and dynamic relationship between the economy (capital accumulation rhythms) and the spatial planning policies and land use regulations (functioning to reproduce social relations of production and social relations generally), develops historically through five periods: the period before 1913, the period between the 1913 Land Act and the commencement of apartheid, the period from 1948 to the 1976 Soweto Revolt, the period of apartheid reformism from 1976 to 1994 and finally the first 21 years of post-apartheid democracy. Within each period the planning of urban space and the designated uses ascribed to different parts of urban land, are analysed in terms of the logic of economic accumulation rhythms, associated planning and land use regulations as well as popular resistance to these, within a context of resource limits as well as the limits on natural sinks recycling industrial pollutants and sequestering carbon.

Historical interweaving of accumulation, reproduction strategies and struggles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Capital Accumulation/Relations of Production</th>
<th>Social Reproduction through planning and land usage</th>
<th>Social Struggle against dominant land use regulations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pre-1913: Creating the Basis for Segregation</strong></td>
<td>Pass laws and segregated housing (in segregated locations) first introduced in the countryside (later including Cape Town and Port Elizabeth) and functioned to control the movement of labour for the agricultural and commercial sectors. Labour requirement of the mining industry met through compounds, which provided a total environment to control worker resistance, theft and the spread of disease (Callinicos, n.d; Davenport, 1971; Dederington, 2012; Home, 2000; Van Aswegen, 1970: 26–27).</td>
<td>The principal forms of resistance were through squatting – which was again a dominance accumulation – and the strikes and other forms of resistance adopted by mine workers against the brutalising controls implemented in the compounds. White mine workers had craft unions that defended their interests</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>1913 to 1948 The Segregation Period</strong></td>
<td>Provisions to segregate the white and black working, ‘clau ser’ urban living places, justified on the basis that blacks were temporary sojourners in ‘white man’s land’ (Terreblanche, 2005: 255). Local authority structures set in place to fund – and control – housing developments for workers by local authorities (Calderwood, 1953). Key legislation enabled greater control over the reproduction of the labour power of the black workforce: municipalities could dispose and repossess existing areas (Mabin and Smil, 1997: 200–202) as segregated townships, control land use, density, building size and position; the right of land tenure was withdrawn (Williamson, 1998: 217), and the right of accommodation in urban townships was linked to employment. Tension in these policies from manufacturing that required a settled urban workforce (Terreblanche, 2005: 279).</td>
<td>Resistance to segregation and controls led by SA Native National Congress (later the ANC), the Industrial and Commercial Workers Union (ICU), the Communist Party as the Confederation of Non-European Trade Unions (CNETU) during the 1930s. The African Mine Workers Union led a famous mine workers strike in 1946, which was suppressed when Smuts ordered the army to drive these workers to the coal face at bayonet point.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

To incorporate ecological and resource limits it is necessary to adopt the insights of ecological economics (Swilling, n.d. 28), the spatial implication of which is localisation of production and food supply, and densification and compactness of urban form due to the imperative to use resources more efficiently in the transition from non-renewable resources to renewable resources. For example, as oil starts becoming too expensive to sustain production and distribution of affordable food we will need to set aside more local spaces for organic urban agriculture. Similarly, as oil-based road motor transport becomes economically unsustainable, we will have to make the transition to electrified rail public transport and the overall land use management systems of our cities will have to be adjusted to include the requisite public transportation infrastructure.

In the history of urban land development in South Africa, agencies representing different class and ethnic interests contested where urban land should be developed and who (i.e. government, private industry or the people) should pay for these developments. The history of the planning of urban space and the management of the usage of land in these spaces has been periodised to reflect some of the key social reproduction interventions and their related economic accumulation rhythms.

The symbiotic and dynamic relationship between the economy (capital accumulation rhythms) and the spatial planning policies and land use regulations (functioning to reproduce social relations of production and social relations generally), develops historically through five periods: the period before 1913, the period between the 1913 Land Act and the commencement of apartheid, the period from 1948 to the 1976 Soweto Revolt, the period of apartheid reformism from 1976 to 1994 and finally the first 21 years of post-apartheid democracy. Within each period the planning of urban space and the designated uses ascribed to different parts of urban land, are analysed in terms of the logic of economic accumulation rhythms, associated planning and land use regulations as well as popular resistance to these, within a context of resource limits as well as the limits on natural sinks recycling industrial pollutants and sequestering carbon.

Historical interweaving of accumulation, reproduction strategies and struggles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Capital Accumulation/Relations of Production</th>
<th>Social Reproduction through planning and land usage</th>
<th>Social Struggle against dominant land use regulations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pre-1913: Creating the Basis for Segregation</strong></td>
<td>Pass laws and segregated housing (in segregated locations) first introduced in the countryside (later including Cape Town and Port Elizabeth) and functioned to control the movement of labour for the agricultural and commercial sectors. Labour requirement of the mining industry met through compounds, which provided a total environment to control worker resistance, theft and the spread of disease (Callinicos, n.d; Davenport, 1971; Dederington, 2012; Home, 2000; Van Aswegen, 1970: 26–27).</td>
<td>The principal forms of resistance were through squatting – which was again a dominance accumulation – and the strikes and other forms of resistance adopted by mine workers against the brutalising controls implemented in the compounds. White mine workers had craft unions that defended their interests</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>1913 to 1948 The Segregation Period</strong></td>
<td>Provisions to segregate the white and black working, ‘clau ser’ urban living places, justified on the basis that blacks were temporary sojourners in ‘white man’s land’ (Terreblanche, 2005: 255). Local authority structures set in place to fund – and control – housing developments for workers by local authorities (Calderwood, 1953). Key legislation enabled greater control over the reproduction of the labour power of the black workforce: municipalities could dispose and repossess existing areas (Mabin and Smil, 1997: 200–202) as segregated townships, control land use, density, building size and position; the right of land tenure was withdrawn (Williamson, 1998: 217), and the right of accommodation in urban townships was linked to employment. Tension in these policies from manufacturing that required a settled urban workforce (Terreblanche, 2005: 279).</td>
<td>Resistance to segregation and controls led by SA Native National Congress (later the ANC), the Industrial and Commercial Workers Union (ICU), the Communist Party as the Confederation of Non-European Trade Unions (CNETU) during the 1930s. The African Mine Workers Union led a famous mine workers strike in 1946, which was suppressed when Smuts ordered the army to drive these workers to the coal face at bayonet point.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Relations of Production
Capital Accumulation/

The MEC regime of accumulation continued under apartheid. Industrial decentralisation strategy – driven by infrastructure and incentives (Todes, 2013: 9) - created accumulation opportunities on homeland borders near to labour supply. Long boom in white property market (Chipkin, 2008: 104–129), decentralised commercial centres, (Beavon, 2000: 3), as financial institutions and insurance companies invested surpluses into shopping malls,1 while property developers diluted traditional role of architects in planning and initiating developments (Chipkin, 2008: 136). 1973 and 1979 global oil crises led to a drop in oil and fuel supply for Western economies, a significant rise in oil prices that fed an inflationary spiral and relative SA economic stagnation (Tereblanche, 2005: 337–340).

Planning urban space and managing land use in segregated townships to control movement of black labour, to build economy only on labour with permanent residential rights (Hindson, 1983, 1985; Posel, 1984, 1985), then a switch to an entirely migrant labour force (Posel, 1984: 6, 15, 23). Anti-squatting policies stopped autonomous community action (Wilkinson, 1981). The state, provided for transportation of workers according to industry needs, got industry to pay for reproduction of labour power costs through the Bantu Services Levy Act. Beer and liquor monopoly sales inside townships in white areas were run by local authorities – later central government administration boards – contributed significantly to meeting the cost of infrastructure and services. Later these funds redirected to newly constructed homeland townships. (Davenport and Hunt, 1975). Spatial planning (the Mzent Committee Reports, the Natural Resources Development Council and the 1975 National Physical Development Plan) (South Africa Union Development Project in Hillbrow).4

Social Reproduction through planning and land usage

1948 to 1979 Apartheid and tightening of controls

Stagflation was the macro-economic context within which increasing labour and community organisation resistance emerged against the imposition of apartheid spatial plans, labour controls and land use management regulations. Key tipping points were the 1973 Durban Strikes, the 1976 Soweto Uprising and the generalised labour and community movements that in the late-1970s emerged in the aftermath of the Soweto Uprising.

1979 to 1994 Revolt and Reform

Financial capital grew to a larger portion of the GDP, concomitant with the deregulation of the economy. New, peripheral urban residential areas and industrial parks were developed. The 1982 Regional Industrial Decentralisation Programme incentivised labour-intensive industries in homeland areas and resulted in some 55 industrial development points in places such as Atlantis, Richards Bay, Isithebe, Butterworth, Dimbaza and Riekerts. Between 1992 and 1997, some 147 000 jobs were created (compared to only 200 000 in the previous 21 years). Employment growth in these peripheral areas was much faster than in the cities, as labour-intensive jobs, particularly in the clothing industry, moved out (Todes, 2013: 10–11). This was also in part because companies were able to secure relatively cheap and disorganised (docile) labour at a time of ‘stagflation’ in the global economy.

Stagflation was the macro-economic context within which increasing labour and community organisation resistance emerged against the imposition of apartheid spatial plans, labour controls and land use management regulations. Key tipping points were the 1973 Durban Strikes, the 1976 Soweto Uprising and the generalised labour and community movements that in the late-1970s emerged in the aftermath of the Soweto Uprising.

Social Struggle against dominant land use regulations

1948 to 1979 Apartheid and tightening of controls

Faced with intensified resistance and capital reformed apartheid reproduction mechanisms by: introducing a private housing market, reforming the labour market, removing restrictions (including trading restrictions), on urban residential rights of a minority of residents (in line with recommendations from Winham2 and the Riekert Commissions3) and selectively upgrading township infrastructure. 1986: pass laws and township regulations abolished. Late-1970s: the state tried to win the ‘hearts and minds’ (ideological reproduction) of township residents by upgrading infrastructure of selected (mainly Witwatersrand) urban townships (SAIRR, 1983: 291; Hendler, 1986: 95), to return stability. Overall geopolitical reproduction strategy increased fragmentation and urban industrial sprawl, resulting in a separation of work and living opportunities, and long travel times and high transport costs for urban residents (i.e. contradictory reproduction of labour power impacts).

1979 to 1994 Revolt and Reform

June 1976 uprising triggered opposition to stringent apartheid controls over land usage. Resistance undermined functioning of local government and municipal services. Central government declared a state of emergency. Army occupied most major townships. Community organisations assumed functions of local government. Civic associations conceptualise (and sometimes implemented) institutional structures, like community development trusts and community land trusts (e.g. in Tshwane, Vryburg and Macassar), housing associations and housing cooperatives (e.g. Seven Buildings Project in Hillbrow).4
High unemployment and inequality have persisted. (Fine, n.d.) – MEC corporates not committed to economic and social restructuring to expose local economy, rather promoting non-value-adding black economic empowerment through financialisation and investing heavily in offshore financial assets. 5 SA economy constrained by integration of global trade and financial flows, huge imbalances between the US, China and Japan, and the 2007/2008 global financial crisis (Mukamal, 2011: 15-16), triggered by oil supply depletion. Volatility likely to continue until we wear our economies of oil and other non-renewable fossil fuels (Rubin, 2009: 207-242). Current financial bubble and oil depletion will reproduce economic volatility and stagnation, making private car transport as well as food more expensive (both dependent on oil and petrochemical intermediate-product inputs). There is a need for transportation and food alternatives in the Johannesburg 42 per cent of households can be classified as ‘food insecure’ (Camarena and Swilling, 2011: 21; Frayne et al., 2009: 1; DGE, 2010: 12) while the road motorised transport sector consumes 78 per cent of liquid fuels in the country (Association for the Study of Peak Oil, 2013: 78).

Within the above historical framework we can now locate specific state spatial reproduction functions in the form of laws and regulations relating to urban land rights, land ownership and environmental conservation. The following section narrates the impact of these factors on class/ethnic segregation, the range of housing types built, the development and underdevelopment of different areas, population densities, and sprawling versus compact infrastructure for development. In each historical period the comparative per capita personal incomes for the different ethnic groups are also given to illustrate the levels if income disparities that mirrored the broader social power imbalances and spatial morphologies.
More nature conservation areas/game parks declared for whites. ‘Homelands’ suffered severe environmental degradation (Sowman et al., 1995: 3). One consequence was the influenza epidemic in the 1920s, claiming the lives of 500,000 Africans (Morris, 1981: 15–16).

White areas were developed philanthropically as part of a crusade to ‘save white workers for civilisation’ (Garden Cities, 1972: 11–12; Citizens Housing League, 1979; Die Stedelike Behuisingsbond, 1970). This stood in stark contrast with the relatively small plots and sometimes informal structures where people of colour lived. Local government rental subsidies were provided for environmental impact: White living/commercial areas, well served with water, sanitation and electrical reticulation while black areas suffered severe environmental problems: in 1960:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Whites</th>
<th>Coloureds</th>
<th>Asians</th>
<th>Africans</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1913</td>
<td>R13,773</td>
<td>R2,151</td>
<td>R3,185</td>
<td>R1,048</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1946</td>
<td>R18,820</td>
<td>R3,068</td>
<td>R4,238</td>
<td>R1,671</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Environmental Impact: Significant atmospheric pollution of African townships – they lacked central heating/fuel. By 1968: five tenancies in Sprawling industrial areas, well served with water, sanitation and electrical reticulation while black areas suffered severe environmental problems: in 1970:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Whites</th>
<th>Coloureds</th>
<th>Asians</th>
<th>Africans</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1970</td>
<td>R22,389</td>
<td>R3,568</td>
<td>R3,828</td>
<td>R2,246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1975</td>
<td>R32,799</td>
<td>R5,684</td>
<td>R6,630</td>
<td>R2,630</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Expert/elitist environmental planning started emerging in the 1970s (Sowman et al., 1995: 50–55). Suburbanisation was in stark contrast with the relatively small plots and sometimes informal structures where people of colour lived.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reproduction Factor</th>
<th>Ethnic/class integration/segregation,</th>
<th>Range of housing types,</th>
<th>Developed/undeveloped areas</th>
<th>Low versus high population densities,</th>
<th>Sprawling versus compact infrastructure,</th>
<th>Per capita personal Incomes by racial group (in constant 1995 Rand)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>1979–1994: retrench and reform</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Urban Land Rights</strong></td>
<td>Control over movement used for Africans with urban rights but tightened up for migrant (contract) workers</td>
<td>Affordable private developer housing for urban insiders. Sold state units, some of which upgraded, entered housing market. Informal structures grew in the backyards and in free-standing settlements.</td>
<td>Distinction between developed white and undeveloped township areas persisted, although certain townships were upgraded in response to social uprisings.</td>
<td>There was an increase in informal settlement, which translated into higher population densities than in the suburbs but still relatively low densities by other third world country standards.</td>
<td>The increasing extent of informal settlement contributed to an already sprawling urban environment</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Land Ownership and Development</strong></td>
<td>Segregation persisted after abolition of pass laws, Group Areas and other racially-based land statutes. Affordability became the criterion of access. Increase in squatting (informal settlements) closer to urban centres.</td>
<td>Homeownership: 1978–80: 2 year–appeal to 1999 year–lease, with building societies housed, 1984: lease title transfer perpetual, converted to freehold, registerable in Deeds office (SA TVBC criteria), selling of 350 000 state units (Hendler, 1996: 95–96; Hendler, 1993: 78; SARR, 1984: 297); and, 1987: developers acquire stands in townships (Urban Foundation, 1987, quoted in Hendler, 1993: 393–394)</td>
<td>With the development of a housing market segregated housing classes soon appeared within existing undeveloped township areas with a smaller elite section comprising the new homeownership class.</td>
<td>Environmental impact regulations (acquiring environmental impact assessments at all stages of the planning of development projects) were incorporated into the spatial planning regime of Integrated Environmental Management (IEM) (Sowman et al., 1995: 30–35).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Environmental Impact</strong></td>
<td>(1987): per capita carbon emissions (white)–9 tons compared to US: 5 tons, globally: 1 ton. Respiratory disease townships from coal stoves (Durrant, 1990: 8–13). 1980s: environmental impact assessments (EIAs) on the agenda (Bowman et al., 1995).</td>
<td>The differentiation of housing types (and classes) in still segmented townships, combined with the upgrading of certain townships, contributed to an improved environment through fully reticulated serviced housing, in some of these areas.</td>
<td>Environmental impact regulations (acquiring environmental impact assessments at all stages of the planning of development projects) were incorporated into the spatial planning regime of Integrated Environmental Management (IEM) (Sowman et al., 1995: 30–35).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>1994–2015: The new dispensation</strong></td>
<td>Urban land rights universally applicable, apartheid restrictions dropped. Economic (employment and affordability) obstacles hinder majority’s ‘right’ to the city, since 2004 prompting protest about inequalities and marginalisation.</td>
<td>Policy objective: centrally located housing, mixed residential/retail commercial development, and a secondary market. However municipalities sold central land, invested proceeds in peripheral RDP housing. Existing property market values expanded while peripherally only basic formal shelter was developed.</td>
<td>Apart from some of the larger and better-known townships – like Soweto – and new areas – like Cornubia (KwaZulu Natal) and Cosmo City (Gauteng) – the old pattern of development of colonial centres and peripheral underdeveloped areas, has persisted.</td>
<td>High land prices confined NGO housing to peripheral townships. 57 per cent of households are excluded from ‘right’ to the city, as they earn less than R5001 per month (including social grants) and are on long waiting lists for government housing. (Appendix, household income profiles).</td>
<td>Government’s stated intention has been to facilitate integration and densification in still segregated townships, although certain townships were upgraded in response to social uprisings.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Land Ownership and Development</strong></td>
<td>Minority from townships moved into gated communities, new township suburbs (e.g., Soweto), new mixed-income projects (e.g., Cosmo City in Gauteng, and Cornubia in Durban), and upgraded/new buildings for rental (e.g., Johannesburg and Pretoria CBDs). Residents unable to afford homeownership re-excluded.</td>
<td>Suburban housing, 1997 to 2008: prices rose by 389 per cent, compared with Ireland (193 per cent) and the United States (66 per cent) (Bond, 2011: 18). Focus on composition contributing to creating scarcity 13 per cent of households (above R15 000 income) afford established housing markets (Appendix, household income profiles). The job ownership market (R1 000,000 and R15 000,000) despite new financial products. Many informal structures erected (NUSP, n.d.).</td>
<td>High land prices confined NGO housing to peripheral townships. 57 per cent of households are excluded from ‘right’ to the city, as they earn less than R5001 per month (including social grants) and are on long waiting lists for government housing. (Appendix, household income profiles).</td>
<td></td>
<td>Government’s stated intention has been to facilitate integration and densification in still segregated townships, although certain townships were upgraded in response to social uprisings.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Environmental Impact</strong></td>
<td>The large-scale provision of electricity has helped to curb the worst atmospheric pollution in previously segregated townships.</td>
<td>Strong biodiversity conservation measures (SANIL, 2003–17), the National Environmental Management Act (NEMA) (No. 107 of 1998) cover pollution control, waste management, environmental authorizations and natural and cultural resource use and conservation. Nevertheless, 57 per cent of river ecosystems and 63 per cent of wetland ecosystems classified as threatened (Ditwe et al., 2003: 56).</td>
<td>Specifications of bioregional plans sometimes not incorporated into municipal IDPs, or sectoral strategies. 10 Examples: in Polokwane, 11 acid mine drainage pollution affecting West Rand informal settlement communities, 12 air pollution (oil refineries and burning biomass in Durban South (South Durban CEA, 2011)), and the exploration for fracking in the Karoo.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Conclusion: Possibilities and Limits for Municipal Interventions

From the history of planning and land use in South Africa, a number of lessons can be drawn about the potential for, and limitations on, municipalities effecting changes.

Simply removing segregationist land use regulations does not create integrated and sustainable living, working and recreational areas. Large parts of the bigger townships like Soweto may have transformed and suburbanised, while some black people have moved into modern white suburbia. However, much more is needed. An important aspect of urban land use is for urban spaces to be identified symbolically, whether as ‘world class cities’, ‘African cities’ or ‘working class cities’.

Municipal land use strategies and practices tend to favour private business interests, often at the expense of redistribution. Privatisation of municipal services, the lax regulation of fossil fuel polluting emissions (e.g. in Durban South) and the World Cup stadiums opened new opportunities for private accumulation by local and global interests. In addition, property rates-based funding incentivises escalating property values (benefitting real estate players, particularly banks), encouraging municipalities to sell their non-core land for the highest price rather than to embrace a role as property developer of prime land to create and reproduce quality of life for the working poor and unemployed.

The municipal funding model inhibits a transition to residential solar energy through feed-in tariffs. However, Eskom’s current crisis might be a ‘burning platform’ that could prompt a change to renewables. At a March 2015 Urban Conference hosted by the SA Cities Network, the Mayor of Tshwane expressed the need for a new municipal funding model that would liberate municipalities from rates-based and trading services funding. However, this will require either transfer payments from national government or a sharing of the taxation of companies operating within municipal jurisdictions.

By the mid-Century there will be unsustainable demand for key material resources as well as rising negative environmental impacts of expanding waste outputs unless there is ‘decoupling of this economic growth from escalating resource use’ (Hodson, et al (2012: 790)). Decoupling means reducing the rate at which primary resources are used per unit of economic output and/or increase economic activity while decreasing negative environmental impacts like pollution, CO2 emissions or the destruction of biodiversity (Hodson, et al, 2012: 798). Compact and densified development in a city environment is a precondition for the efficient usage of resources, which also provides an opportunity for decoupling economic growth from escalating resource use (Camaren and Swilling, 2011). By circumscribing the roll out of infrastructure, compaction and densification create a platform for the efficient use (and re-use) of all resources (e.g. water, energy, forests, wetlands, etc) and thereby extend the time frame of the functioning ecological platform of urban-based societies and economies. Decoupling might open the door for a more fundamental restructuring of the urban form but this is not guaranteed.

The way in which municipalities spatially plan and implement services and land usage is likely to come under more pressure from spontaneous protests, creating pressure for change. In an increasingly volatile environment, municipalities will have an interest in stability. They might resort to repression (e.g. eviction of informal traders and squatters, cutting off water and electricity supplies to defaulters, etc.) but this will secure stability only in the short term, given the underlying macro-economic drivers of protest activity. In the medium to long term, negotiations with representative and organised community groups could lead to agreements with protesting communities and a greater likelihood of stability. The SPLUMA contains the statutory framework for agreements with communities aimed at enhancing their right to the city. Embedded in this framework are principles of spatial justice and spatial sustainability, which justify strategies for improving the working class’s access to cities and quality of life. These above principles, together with the principles of financial sustainability, administrative sustainability, efficiency, transparency and public interest, form an overall guide for municipal governance, spatial plans and land-use management that support the development of working-class urban spaces for living, working and recreation. Within the overall framework of the principles enunciated by SPLUMA, the Constitution and the Municipal Finance Management Act, municipalities need to formulate processes and procedures for acquiring, holding, developing and releasing land.

Whether negotiations between municipalities and community representatives take place and develop into a different set of spatial planning and land use practices will depend on the role of progressive senior municipal officials, such as the Stellenbosch Municipal Manager who facilitated the memorandum of understanding with the Informal Settlements Network (ISN) for upgrading the Langrug informal settlement (outside Franschoek). The Langrug organisers also developed strong relationships with municipal officials responsible for providing and maintaining services to human settlements and with the planning departments of academic institutions, which helped envision – and plan – a different, connected Langrug in the future.

---

6 Edgar Schein’s burning platform theory is that for people to make a leap from today’s platform to the relative unknown, it must be more uncomfortable for them to stay on today’s platform than the perceived anxiety created by the change to tomorrow’s desired future (Alan, 2010)

7 These strategies and processes were developed by the author and a colleague as part of a professional service for the Housing Development Agency (HDA) during 2012.

8 Hendler P. 2014. ‘Using hindsight to organise better – grassroots service solutions, Cape Times, 30 January.'
Appendix

South African households that qualify for housing subsidies or can afford a mortgage loan

![Image](source: StatsSA, Census 2011)

References


Anthonissen, C 2015 Multilingual Spaces as Contact Zones: ‘Critical’ things we need to know about Critical Linguistics, Inaugural Lecture, Stellenbosch University, 16 April


Association for the Study of Peak Oil, 2013 Energy and Transport Status Quo: Demand and Vulnerabilities (unpublished), a report submitted to the National Department of Transport


Butt PE. 1984 The Growth and Development of the Organised Building Industry in the Western Cape with an Investigation into the Forces that have Shaped It, Dissertation submitted to the Faculty of Architecture and Allied Disciplines of the University of Natal, Durban in complete fulfilment of the requirements for the Degree of Master of Science (Building Management), Cape Town, January

Calderwood, D 1953 Native Housing in South Africa, a dissertation submitted to the University of the Witwatersrand for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy


Camaren, P and Swilling, M 2011 Sustainable, Low-Carbon Cities in the 21st Century – Making it Happen! Paper for the Summit for the Urban Environmental Accords, October 11-13, Gwangju, South Korea Commissioned by UNEP

Citizens Housing League, 1979 1929 – 1979: 50 Years Service, the Citizens Housing League, Cape Town


Department of Environmental Affairs. 2011 The National Strategy for Sustainable Development and Action Plan (NSSD1)


Durning, A 1990 Apartheid's Environmental Toll, Worldwatch Institute Paper, May

During, A 1990 Apartheid's Environmental Toll, Worldwatch Institute Paper, May

Durning, A 1990 Apartheid's Environmental Toll, Worldwatch Institute Paper, May


Frayne, B Battersby-Lennard, J Fincham, R. and Haysom, G 2009 Urban Food Security


Hodgson P. 1986 Capital Accumulation, the State and the Housing Question: The Private Allocation of Residences in African Townships on the Witwatersrand 1980 to 1985, A thesis submitted to the University of the Witwatersrand in fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts in the Faculty of Arts, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg


Hodgson P 1992 Living in Apartheid's Shadow, Urban Forum, 3(2), 39-80 June

Hodgson P 1993 Privatised Housing Delivery, Housing Markets and Housing Policy: Residential Land Development for Africans in the Pretoria/Witwatersrand/ Vereeniging Region between 1975 and 1991, a thesis submitted to the Faculty of Arts, University of the Witwatersrand, for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Hodgson P 2010 Governance, Housing and Sustainable Neighbourhoods, in Swilling M Sustaining Cape Town – Imagining a Livable City, Sustainability Institute and Sun Press, Stellenbosch

Hodgson P 2013 Personal Communication with Professor Francois Viruly, Property Specialist, March

Hodgson P 2014 Using Hindsight to Organise Better – Grassroots Service Solutions, in Cape Times 30 January


Hodgson P 2015b Urban Land History - Dynamics which still influence the present, a working paper for the SA Cities Network Working Paper Series on Urban Land


Hindson, D 1985 The Pass System and Differentiated Labour Power, paper presented to the Association for Sociology in Southern Africa (ASSA) conference, University of Cape Town, July

Hirsh, J 2010 Community Protests in South Africa: Trends, Analysis and Explanations, the Local Government Working Paper Series, Community Law Centre, University of the Western Cape, available on line at http://www.communitylawcentre.org.za/Projects/Local-Government


Lefebvre H. 1968. *Le Droit à la ville* Paris


National Upgrading Support Programme (NUSP) (n.d.) available on line at http://www.upgradingsupport.org/content/page/history


Ngwane, T and Vilakazi, N n.d. The Anti-Privatisation Forum and Campaign against Xenophobia, Centre for Sociological Research, University of Johannesburg

Noseweek, 2013 “2013 – Here comes the poison”, No 162, April, 10-13


Parnell, S 1987 Council Housing Provision for Whites in Johannesburg: 1920 – 1955, A Dissertation submitted to the Faculty of Arts, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, for the Degree of Master of Arts

Posel, D 1984 Providing for the Legitimate Labour Requirements of Employers, paper presented to the African Studies Seminar, African Studies Institute, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg

Posel, D 1985 Interests, Conflict and Power: The Relationship between the State and business in South Africa during the 1950s, paper presented to the Association for Sociology in Southern Africa (ASSA) conference, University of Cape Town, July


RSA 16/2013, Republic of South Africa, Spatial Planning and Land Use Management Act, no 16 of 2013

Rubin J 2009 Why your world is about to get a whole lot smaller – oil and the end of globalisation, Random House, New York

SANBI (South African National Biodiversity Institute), 2014. Biodiversity Mainstreaming Toolbox for land-use planning and development in Gauteng, Compiled by ICLEI – Local Governments for Sustainability

SAIRR, 1977 South African Institute of Race Relations – A Survey of Race Relations 1976, SAIRR, Johannesburg


SAIRR, 1984 South African Institute of Race Relations – Survey of Race Relations 1984, SAIRR, Johannesburg


Segar S 2013 “Wonderwoman – Gauteng’s Last Hope”, in Noseweek 162, April, 14-16

Silverman, M and Zack, T 2008 Housing Delivery, the Urban Crisis and Xenophobia, in Hassim, S Tawana, K and Worby, E (ed) *Go Home or Die Here*, Wits University Press, Johannesburg

South Africa Union 1955 The Report of the Committee appointed to Investigate the Question of Residential Areas for Natives in the East Rand Area (the Mentz Report), Part Four, (in Afrikaans), Johannesburg Municipal Library

South Durban Community Environmental Alliance, 2011 Feeling the Heat in Durban, in Bond, P (ed) *Durban’s Climate Gamble – Trading Carbon Betting the Earth*, 117-140, Unisa Press, University of South Africa


Swilling M. (n.d.) Greening Public Value: This Sustainability Challenge, in Bennington J and Moore M In *Sustaining Cape Town – Imagining a Livable City*, Sun Press-Sustainability Institute, Stellenbosch


Todes A 2013 Spatial Targeting: Lessons from South African Experience, Background Report for the Cities Support Programme (CSP) Workshop on Spatial Targeting, 3 to 4 October


Vally, N 2009. National trends around protest action: mapping protest action in South Africa, Study undertaken on behalf of the Centre for Sociological Research (CSR) and the Freedom of Expression Institute, presented to CSR and Development Studies Seminar


Endnotes

1 Cf. Hendler, 2013: Personal communication with Professor Francois Viruly, Property Specialist, March 2013
2 On 1 May 1979, the first interim report of the Wiehahn Commission was tabled in Parliament. The Wiehahn Commission was set up by the government after the Durban strikes of 1973 and the Soweto uprisings of 1976 to look at industrial relations system in South Africa.
3 The government appointed the Riekert Commission to consider ways of adapting the influx control laws to meet rapidly changing economic and political challenges.
4 See Hendler (1993: 378–387) and Hendler and Spiropolous (1991) for a further discussion on the details and contradictions inherent in community participation, residential planning and product delivery.
5 Fine (n.d.) refers to illegal capital flight from South Africa as a percentage of GDP rising from 5,4 per cent between 1980 and 1993 to 9,2 per cent between 1994 and 2000. He also notes Treasury reporting that indicates that between 1991 and 2000 there was an overall nett foreign direct investment (FDI) outflow of R386 million per quarter and that the total stock of outward FDI had grown from $8,7 billion in 1995 to $28,8 billion in 2004. Fine (n.d.) also aligns the value of unbundling of conglomerates at R80 billion in 1999 with the 1998 raising of the limits of investments abroad by local conglomerates to R50 million per company, and the expansion of the financial sector to 20 per cent of GDP by 2007 and its rate of expansion being twice the rate of GDP.
6 Terreblanche (2012: 3, 6, 69) argues that the ANC government was in a relatively weak position in 1994, ‘as its sovereignty was fairly seriously restricted by the conditionalities that were made applicable when our economy was integrated into the structure of global capitalism’. Terreblanche adds that through leading ANC figures receiving ‘ideological training at American universities and international banks’, pressure from Western governments and international institutions (like the IMF and World Bank) as well as secret negotiations (held at the Development Bank of Southern Africa) the ANC was brought over to the view that neo-liberal globalism and market fundamentalism would be economically advantageous for South Africa – the new governing elite also had definite material interests in participating in this process through being empowered to allocate affirmative action and affirmative procurement contracts.
7 Terreblanche, 2005: 393; for 2011 figures see Appendix
9 Transkei/Venda/Bophuthatswana/Ciskei
10 Based on consulting services provided to several metropolitan municipalities in terms of the CSP.