Hashimoto thyroiditis is an independent cardiovascular risk factor in clinically hypothyroid patients

Mohammed N. Atta, Rawhia Elessawy, Akram Deghedy, Ahmed Hafez, Tamer M. Elsherbiny

Department of Internal Medicine, Endocrinology Unit, Alexandria Faculty of Medicine, Egypt
Department of Clinical and Chemical Pathology, Alexandria Faculty of Medicine, Egypt
Department of Radiodiagnosis and Intervention, Alexandria Faculty of Medicine, Egypt

Received 24 August 2011; accepted 25 September 2011
Available online 22 October 2011

KEYWORDS
Hypothyroidism; Hashimoto thyroiditis; CIMT; FMD; Nitric oxide

Abstract
Hypothyroidism is a common disorder that confers an increased cardiovascular risk. The most common cause is Hashimoto thyroiditis (HT) but it can also be caused by thyroidectomy and radioiodine therapy. The aim of the study is to examine whether there is a relation between the cause of hypothyroidism and cardiovascular risk.

Subjects and methods: The study included 20 patients with Hashimoto thyroiditis and hypothyroidism, 20 patients with post-thyroidectomy hypothyroidism, 20 patients with post-radioiodine hypothyroidism, and 20 age and sex matched controls. In all the studied subjects we determined thyroid function tests; TSH and F.T4, thyroid auto-antibodies; anti-TPO and anti-TG antibodies, carotid intima media thickness (CIMT), flow mediated dilation (FMD) and serum nitric oxide.

Results: CIMT showed a trend to be higher in HT group (0.93 ± 0.08 mm) compared to other causes of hypothyroidism (P = 0.090). Multivariate analysis showed that HT is an independent predictor of CIMT (P = 0.015). FMD was significantly lower in HT group (5.74 ± 1.33%) compared to post-thyroidectomy (7.16 ± 1.05%) (P = 0.001), and post-radioiodine therapy (7.34 ± 1.34%) (P = 0.000). Multivariate analysis showed that HT is an independent predictor of FMD (P = 0.000). NO was significantly higher in hypothyroid patients (125.98 ± 5.03 μM/
Hypothyroidism is the most common pathological hormonal deficiency and is more common in females and the elderly. Overt hypothyroidism in the general population occurs in about 0.3% reaching 1.7% in elderly individuals ≥65 years and up to 2% in women older than 60 years of age.\textsuperscript{2,3}

Prevalence of subclinical hypothyroidism differs according to the studied population, from 4.3% to 8.5% in patients without history of thyroid disease\textsuperscript{2,4} reaching 20% in females more than 65 years of age and up to 16% of males and 21% of females older than 74 years.\textsuperscript{4}

Autoimmune thyroiditis (AIT) is an inflammatory condition of the thyroid gland characterized by intrathyroidal lymphocytic infiltration, ultrasonographic signs of inflammation and antibodies to thyroglobulin, thyroperoxidase (TPO) or both. AIT includes Hashimoto’s thyroiditis, painless postpartum thyroiditis and painless sporadic thyroiditis.\textsuperscript{5} A diagnosis of Hashimoto’s thyroiditis is made when there is a diffuse swelling of the thyroid without any other cause in addition to any of the following: positive for anti-thyroperoxidase antibodies, positive for anti-thyroglobulin antibodies or the presence of lymphocytic infiltration of the thyroid gland.\textsuperscript{6}

Predictors of hypothyroidism in HT include: female sex, high normal TSH > 2.5 is the strongest predictor of hypothyroidism with the prevalence of hypothyroidism being 12% with baseline TSH of 2.5 and 87.5% with a baseline TSH of 4 and lastly positive anti-thyroid antibodies.\textsuperscript{7}

Thyroidectomy operation may be total thyroidectomy (TT) in which the entire thyroid gland is removed or partial thyroidectomy which is further subdivided into: (1) near total thyroidectomy (NT), where less than 3 g of the gland is left behind, (2) subtotal thyroidectomy (ST), where no more than 25% of a single lobe is left and (3) hemithyroidectomy (HT) or lobectomy, where only one lobe is excised.\textsuperscript{8}

Total thyroidectomy, by definition, causes hypothyroidism; near total thyroidectomy causes hypothyroidism in 85–100%.\textsuperscript{9} Occurrence of hypothyroidism following subtotal thyroidectomy depends on a number of factors: age (there is a positive relation between age and thyroid function),\textsuperscript{10} gender (there is a negative relation between male gender and thyroid function),\textsuperscript{10} thyroid remnant volume/weight; the only modifiable factor (there is a strong negative correlation between remnant volume and TSH)\textsuperscript{11} and ultrasond aspect of the thyroid remnant (hypoechocoe aspect on ultrasound which may be due to inflammatory alterations) strongly predicted hypothyroidism. When ultrasound aspect and weight of the remnant are combined minimal thyroid remnant volume required to prevent hypothyroidism in isoechocoe aspect is 4.2 ml.\textsuperscript{11}

Occurrence of hypothyroidism following hemithyroidectomy depends on a number of factors: marked lymphocytic infiltration (grade 3 or 4),\textsuperscript{12–14} preoperative TSH > 2–3,\textsuperscript{15} detectable TPO Ab and Tg Ab,\textsuperscript{16–18} Hashimoto’s thyroiditis and MNG,\textsuperscript{19,20} remnant lobe volume ≤ 4 ml,\textsuperscript{21} long standing disease before operation,\textsuperscript{10} low iodine intake status,\textsuperscript{22} low initial free T4\textsuperscript{23} and right hemithyroidectomy.\textsuperscript{24}

Radioiodine has been used for the treatment of hyperthyroidism since 1940; it is used for the treatment of hyperthyroidism due to Grave’s disease or toxic multinodular goiter.\textsuperscript{25,26} It is considered the 1st line treatment for Grave’s disease and the treatment of choice for relapsed Grave’s and toxic MNG.\textsuperscript{27}

The optimum outcome is to achieve euthyroidism without relapse or hypothyroidism. However, it is impossible to titrate the dose of radioiodine to accurately guarantee euthyroidism.\textsuperscript{28} Predictors of hypothyroidism following radioiodine for hyperthyroidism include: small thyroid volume, mild hyperthyroidism (mildly elevated initial free T4),\textsuperscript{29} high radioiodine activity,\textsuperscript{29,31} Grave’s disease rather than toxic MNG,\textsuperscript{31,32} higher TSH especially in toxic MNG,\textsuperscript{32,33} use of recombinant human TSH (rhTSH),\textsuperscript{34,35} female gender and older age.\textsuperscript{39,36}

Hypothyroidism is an independent risk factor for myocardial infarction (MI), aortic atherosclerosis and CHD events and mortality through altering traditional and nontraditional risk factors for cardiovascular disease; including: dyslipidemia (high total cholesterol, LDL cholesterol, sd-LDL, [Lp(a)], chyomicron remnants and a low HDL cholesterol),\textsuperscript{37,38} hyper-tension (three times more prevalent in hypothyroidism than in euthyroid subjects),\textsuperscript{37} homocysteine (increased in hypothyroidism due to decreased clearance),\textsuperscript{37} oxidative stress\textsuperscript{39} and endothelial dysfunction.\textsuperscript{40}

Nitric oxide (NO) is one of the most abundant free-radicals in the body and excess NO production causes mitochondrial respiratory enzyme inhibition. Although the formed O\textsubscript{2} is scavenged by super oxide dismutase (SOD), NO is the only known biological molecule that reacts faster with superoxide and is produced in high concentrations enough to outcompete endogenous levels of superoxide dismutase. If NO production is increased, short-lived NO rapidly reacts with O\textsubscript{2} to form a potent and powerful long-lived oxidant free-radical, peroxynitrite (ONOO\textsuperscript{-}). This decomposes into the hydroxyl radical OH\textsuperscript{-}, which is one of the most active ROS that oxidizes LDL.\textsuperscript{41}

Increased peroxynitrite production, resulted in increased apoptotic cell death in atheromatous plaques of human coronary arteries.\textsuperscript{42} Thus when oxidant defenses become depleted or endogenous tissue rates of oxidant production are accelerated, NO gives rise to secondary oxidizing species that increase membrane and lipoprotein lipid oxidation as well as foam cell formation in the vasculature.\textsuperscript{43}

Endothelial cells respond to physical stimuli (e.g., shear stress), hormones, cytokines, drugs, and substances released by sensory and autonomic nerves or platelets by producing vasoactive relaxing substances (e.g. NO) and contracting substances (e.g. endothelin-1) that regulate vascular tone and permeability, hemostasis, angiogenesis, and inflammation. The vascular endothelium sustains the balance between...
prevention and stimulation of platelet aggregation, thrombogenesis and fibrinolysis, promotion and inhibition of the smooth muscle cell proliferation and migration, and also between vasoconstriction and vasodilation. The disruption of this tightly controlled balance leads to the development of endothelial dysfunction which represents a predominant early feature of atherosclerosis.44

Endothelial dysfunction represents a key early step in the development of atherosclerosis and is also involved in plaque progression and the occurrence of atherosclerotic complications. Endothelial dysfunction significantly increased the risk of vascular events in asymptomatic patients with early stages of atherosclerosis.45

Evidence supports the view that the endothelial dysfunction associated with atherosclerosis is related to the local formation of reactive oxygen and nitrogen species in the vicinity of the vascular endothelium.44

Impaired brachial artery FMD; a marker of endothelial dysfunction; is an independent predictor of long-term in-stent restenosis after percutaneous intervention PCI.46 incident cardiovascular events (MI, stroke and death) in an unselected, multi-ethnic population without a history of myocardial infarction or stroke47 and postoperative cardiovascular events in patients undergoing nonemergent vascular surgery.48 It also can identify subjects with asymptomatic coronary artery disease.49

CIMT (carotid intima media thickness) is a validated tool for noninvasive measurement of early asymptomatic (subclinical) atherosclerotic disease. Carotid IMT independently predicts future vascular events (MI, stroke, and cardiovascular death). Its predictive value is at least as high in younger subjects as in older subjects.50 Increase in CIMT is not only associated with the presence of coronary artery disease CAD but also with the extent of CAD.51

Our aim is to study the relation between the cause of hypothyroidism, Hashimoto thyroiditis, surgery and radioactive iodine and cardiovascular risk in clinically hypothyroid patients.

2. Subjects

The study was carried out on 80 subjects attending the Internal Medicine and the Endocrinology Outpatient Clinics in Alexandria Main University Hospital, who were categorized into four groups: Group I: included 20 patients with chronic autoimmune thyroiditis (diagnosed by anti-thyroid antibodies and thyroid ultrasound) and hypothyroidism defined as TSH > 7 μIU/ml and F.T4 < 9 pmol/l, Group II: included 20 patients with post-thyroidectomy hypothyroidism, Group III: included 20 patients with post-irradiation hypothyroidism, Group IV: included 20 healthy subjects of matched age and sex as a control group.

Exclusion criteria were patients with a history of diabetes mellitus, hypertension, familial dyslipidemia, renal failures, any degree of glucose intolerance and known or symptomatic cardiovascular disease.

3. Methods

3.1. History and examination

Thorough history taking and complete physical examination for signs and symptoms of hypothyroidism, cardiovascular disease, diabetes and hypertension was performed. Height, weight and waist circumference were measured and BMI was calculated by the formula wt in kilograms/(ht)² in meters.

3.2. Assessment of thyroid function and autoimmunity

Thyroid function was assessed by the determination of thyroid-stimulating hormone (TSH) ELISA, LDN-Germany; reference range 0.4–7 μIU/ml and free T4 (Free t-thyroxine ELISA, LDN-Germany); reference range 9.0–22.2 pmol/l.53 Thyroid autoimmunity was assessed by the determination of thyroperoxidase antibodies (SERION ELISA classic, Institut Virion/serion GmbH-Germany); a normal range of less 50 IU/ml and thyroglobulin antibodies (anti-thyroglobulin ELISA, LDN-Germany); a normal range of less 100 IU/ml.54

3.3. Assessment of asymptomatic (subclinical) atherosclerotic; carotid intima media thickness (CIMT)

We assessed the CIMT in compliance with the recommendation of the American society of echocardiography consensus statement in 2008 for the use of ultrasonography for the measurement of CIMT.55 Longitudinal images from three imaging planes: anterior, lateral, and posterior with clear images of distal CCA (distal 1 cm of each CCA) in a perfectly horizontal plane with double lines on near and far walls, indicating true perpendicular scanning plane with a linear-array transducer operating at a fundamental frequency of at least 7 MHz (B-mode imaging). Mean CIMT values from the far walls of the right and left CCAs (mean–mean) was reported; Mean–mean (average of segmental mean CIMT values) values are more reproducible because multiple points along the traced segment are averaged. CIMT values greater than or equal to 75th percentile are considered high and indicative of increased CVD risk.56

3.4. Assessment of endothelial function; flow mediated dilation (FMD)

The subjects were investigated by high-resolution color Doppler ultrasound imaging of the brachial artery in the dominant arm in a darkened, temperature controlled room. Furthermore, allowing the participants to rest for 10 min before the study permits hemodynamic stabilization and thus guarantees more accurate baseline readings.

Subjects were instructed to refrain from alcohol and strenuous exercise for 24 h prior to the study, abstain from smoking, vasoactive medicine, caffeine and high-fat food for at least 2 h, as these can all affect FMD.

The study was performed with subjects resting in the supine position. Study participants fasted for 8 h prior to the exam. The subjects’ dominant arm was comfortably immobilized in the extended position to allow consistent access to the brachial artery. For each subject, optimal brachial artery images were obtained approximately 5 cm above the antecubital fossa. Arm pressure was caused by inflating a pneumatic arm cuff up to 50 mm Hg higher than the subject’s systolic arterial pressure for 5 min. Doppler ultrasound measurements were performed before and 60 s after reactive hyperemia. To avoid interobserver variability, all measurements were performed by the same examiner, who was blind to the subjects’ clinical status.

The internal diameter of the brachial artery (at the intima–lumen interface) was assessed at the end of diastole. The
baseline diameter is measured as an average of three frames and the peak as the mean of three consecutive images measured at the time of the maximal increase in diameter after cuff release and the values were recorded.

FMD was calculated according to the formula:
FMD = (post-occlusion diameter – baseline diameter) × 100 / baseline diameter.\(^{57}\)

3.5. Assessment of oxidative stress; serum nitric oxide (NO)

Nitric oxide levels were determined with a colorimetric method based on the Griess reaction. Sodium nitrite was used as a standard, and the results were expressed as \(\mu\)M/ml.\(^{58}\)

4. Results

All studied groups were matched for age, sex, BMI and waist circumference. (Tables 1 and 2).

None of our subjects had renal impairment nor impaired glucose tolerance although there were statistically significant higher levels of FPG, urea and creatinine in hypothyroid patients compared to control, these parameters also showed a significant negative correlation with F.T4 and a positive correlation with TSH (Tables 1, 2 and 4).

Total cholesterol, low density lipoprotein (LDL) cholesterol and triglycerides (TG) showed statistically significant higher levels in hypothyroid subjects than in control group \((P = 0.001)\) (Tables 1 and 2).

Statistical analysis shows that there was no significant difference in the mean high density lipoprotein (HDL) cholesterol between all studied groups \((P = 0.960)\) (Tables 1 and 2).

Anti-TPO antibodies were significantly higher in hypothyroidism than in the control group \((P = 0.001)\), also significantly higher in HT than in other studied groups (Tables 1–3).

Anti-TG antibodies were significantly higher in hypothyroidism than control group \((P = 0.007)\), also significantly higher in HT than in other studied groups (Tables 1–3).

Thyroid ultrasound: Group I demonstrated 70% diffuse hypoechogenicity, 10% showed atrophic gland, 25% diffuse goiter and 10% multinodular goiter.

CIMT was significantly higher in hypothyroidism than control group \((P = 0.001)\). CIMT was non-significantly \((a\ trend\ to\ increase)\) higher in HT compared to post-thyroidectomy and to post-RAI \((P = 0.090)\) (Tables 1–3).

FMD was significantly lower in hypothyroidism than control group \((P = 0.001)\), also FMD was significantly lower in HT compared to post-thyroidectomy \((P = 0.000)\) and to post-RAI \((P = 0.001)\) (Tables 1 and 2).

Serum nitric oxide was significantly higher in hypothyroidism than control group \((P = 0.001)\) (Tables 1 and 2).

---

### Table 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>Hypothyroid</th>
<th>Control</th>
<th>(P)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Age (Y)</strong></td>
<td>41.85 ± 9.50</td>
<td>41.40 ± 9.75</td>
<td>0.936</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>BMI</strong></td>
<td>25.91 ± 1.46</td>
<td>25.70 ± 1.34</td>
<td>0.766</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>WC (cm)</strong></td>
<td>89.15 ± 7.23</td>
<td>86.30 ± 6.47</td>
<td>0.286</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Urea (mg/dl)</strong></td>
<td>35.65 ± 3.41</td>
<td>19.65 ± 2.14</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Creatinine (mg/dl)</strong></td>
<td>0.96 ± 0.04</td>
<td>0.76 ± 0.06</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>FPG (mg/dl)</strong></td>
<td>90.82 ± 5.60</td>
<td>79.70 ± 5.27</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Hb</strong></td>
<td>11.96 ± 1.39</td>
<td>13.20 ± 0.66</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TC (mg/dl)</strong></td>
<td>262.05 ± 30.66</td>
<td>193.35 ± 14.58</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TG (mg/dl)</strong></td>
<td>140.37 ± 39.19</td>
<td>107.40 ± 18.03</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>HDL (mg/dl)</strong></td>
<td>53.18 ± 10.0</td>
<td>54.80 ± 6.93</td>
<td>0.747</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>LDL (mg/dl)</strong></td>
<td>173.00 ± 22.49</td>
<td>145.00 ± 14.64</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Hb</strong></td>
<td>34.06 ± 8.67</td>
<td>2.69 ± 1.81</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Free T4 (pmol/l)</strong></td>
<td>7.21 ± 1.21</td>
<td>14.47 ± 2.48</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Anti-TG (IU/ml)</strong></td>
<td>74.07 ± 38.82</td>
<td>28.15 ± 9.44</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Anti-TPO (IU/ml)</strong></td>
<td>195.12 ± 472.04</td>
<td>8.43 ± 7.26</td>
<td>0.112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>NO (μM/ml)</strong></td>
<td>125.98 ± 5.03</td>
<td>39.44 ± 3.63</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CIMT (mm)</strong></td>
<td>0.90 ± 0.08</td>
<td>0.67 ± 0.06</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>FMD (%)</strong></td>
<td>6.75 ± 1.42</td>
<td>14.28 ± 1.65</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

Group I: Hashimoto thyroiditis, Group II: post-thyroidectomy hypothyroidism, Group III: post-RAI hypothyroidism, Group IV: control.
There was a positive correlation between serum nitric oxide and anti-TPO antibodies ($r = 0.474$) which was significant ($P = 0.000$) (Table 4).

There was a statistically significant positive correlation between serum nitric oxide and CIMT ($r = 0.766$) ($P = 0.000$), as well as a statistically significant negative correlation between serum nitric oxide and FMD ($r = -0.883$) ($P = 0.000$) (Table 4).

There was a statistically significant positive correlation between CIMT and TSH ($r = 0.725$) ($P = 0.000$), age ($r = 0.566$) ($P = 0.000$), waist circumference ($r = 0.253$) ($P = 0.011$), Total cholesterol ($r = 0.630$) ($P = 0.000$), LDL cholesterol ($r = 0.689$) ($P = 0.000$), anti-TPO antibodies ($r = 0.566$) ($P = 0.000$) and serum nitric oxide ($r = 0.766$) ($P = 0.000$), while there was statistically significant negative correlation between CIMT and F.T4 ($r = -0.749$) ($P = 0.000$) (Table 4).

There was statistically significant negative correlation between FMD and TSH ($r = -0.910$) ($P = 0.000$), anti-TPO antibodies ($r = -0.826$) ($P = 0.000$), total cholesterol ($r = -0.911$) ($P = 0.000$) and TG ($r = -0.288$) ($P = 0.004$), and serum nitric oxide ($r = -0.883$) ($P = 0.000$), while there was a statistically significant positive correlation between FMD and F.T4 ($r = 0.799$) ($P = 0.000$) (Table 4).

All the correlations were made for all subjects in all studied groups.

### 4.1. Multivariate analysis of different factors which affect CIMT

Multivariate analysis showed that the diagnosis of Hashimoto thyroiditis is independent of thyroid function, age, WC and dyslipedemia affected or “predicted” CIMT ($P = 0.015$). There are other factors affecting CIMT in the same model which are age ($P = 0.000$), waist circumference ($P = 0.000$), F.T4 ($P = 0.027$) and interestingly serum nitric oxide ($P = 0.000$) (Table 5).

### Table 3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dependent variable</th>
<th>(I) Diagnosis</th>
<th>(J) Diagnosis</th>
<th>Mean difference (I−J)</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TC</td>
<td>HT</td>
<td>RAI</td>
<td>36.2500(*)</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>SUR</td>
<td>13.1000</td>
<td>0.132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LDL</td>
<td>HT</td>
<td>RAI</td>
<td>34.5000(*)</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>SUR</td>
<td>10.2000</td>
<td>0.069</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TSH</td>
<td>HT</td>
<td>RAI</td>
<td>14.2550(*)</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>SUR</td>
<td>2.2950</td>
<td>0.236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anti-TG</td>
<td>HT</td>
<td>RAI</td>
<td>289.0665</td>
<td>0.068</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>SUR</td>
<td>391.4555(*)</td>
<td>0.014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anti-TPO</td>
<td>HT</td>
<td>RAI</td>
<td>50.9000(*)</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>SUR</td>
<td>60.0500(*)</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FMD</td>
<td>HT</td>
<td>RAI</td>
<td>−1.5975(*)</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>SUR</td>
<td>−1.4240(*)</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


*The mean difference is significant at the .05 level.

### Table 4

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>NO</th>
<th>CIMT</th>
<th>FMD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>WC</td>
<td>$r$</td>
<td>$P$</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.191</td>
<td>0.057</td>
<td>0.214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FPG</td>
<td>$r$</td>
<td>$P$</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.443(**)</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.470(**)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TG</td>
<td>$r$</td>
<td>$P$</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.299(**)</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.224(*)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TC</td>
<td>$r$</td>
<td>$P$</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.642(**)</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.630(**)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LDL</td>
<td>$r$</td>
<td>$P$</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.704(**)</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.689(**)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>$r$</td>
<td>$P$</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.034</td>
<td>0.734</td>
<td>80.003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F.T4</td>
<td>$r$</td>
<td>$P$</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>−0.725(**)</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>−0.749(**)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TSH</td>
<td>$r$</td>
<td>$P$</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.822(**)</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.725(**)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anti-TG</td>
<td>$r$</td>
<td>$P$</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.240(*)</td>
<td>0.024</td>
<td>0.435(**)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anti-TPO</td>
<td>$r$</td>
<td>$P$</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.474(**)</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.566(**)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NO</td>
<td>$r$</td>
<td>$P$</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.766(**)</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed).

**Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).
4.2. Multivariate analysis of different factors which affect FMD

Multivariate analysis showed that the diagnosis of Hashimoto thyroiditis is independent of thyroid function, age and dyslipidemia affected or predicted FMD ($P = 0.000$), other factors affecting FMD in the same model are LDL cholesterol ($P = 0.000$), F.T4 ($P = 0.046$) and interestingly serum nitric oxide ($P = 0.000$) (Table 6).

5. Discussion

5.1. Markers of subclinical atherosclerosis in hypothyroidism

Our results show that CIMT is significantly higher in overt hypothyroidism compared to control and correlated positively to TSH and negatively to F.T4. Univariate analysis showed that CIMT was also correlated to age, WC, total cholesterol, LDL cholesterol and serum nitric oxide.

Regarding the effect of the cause of hypothyroidism on CIMT, we observed a trend toward higher values of CIMT in HT compared to post-thyroidectomy and post-RAI that was not statistically significant; however, multivariate analysis showed that HT; independent of age, WC, F.T4 and NO; predicted CIMT with statistical significance.

In accordance with our work, Nagasaki et al. and Kim et al. showed that both overt and subclinical hypothyroidism increased CIMT. They explained this by an atherogenic lipid profile as both increased CIMT and dyslipidemia were reversible after achieving euthyroidism. They also suggested other explanations like low grade inflammation and activation of the immune system by Hashimoto thyroiditis.

Takamura et al. showed that TSH, as well as fT4, within normal reference range, was significantly correlated with CIMT after adjustment for known cardiovascular risk factors.

On the other hand, Cabral et al. showed that there is no significant difference observed with respect to CIMT between the SCH and control groups. The explanation was that they chose subjects who were matched with respect to age, BMI, smoking, menopausal status, and lipid profile.

5.2. Markers of endothelial dysfunction

Our results show that FMD is significantly lower in overt and hypothyroidism compared to the control and correlated negatively to TSH and positively to F.T4, univariate analysis showed that FMD was also correlated to age, anti-TPO antibodies, total cholesterol, LDL cholesterol and serum nitric oxide.

Regarding the effect of the cause of hypothyroidism on FMD, we observed that FMD was significantly lower in HT compared to post-thyroidectomy and post-RAI; also, multivariate analysis showed that HT, independent of LDL-C, F.T4 and NO, predicted FMD with statistical significance.

In accordance with our work, Clausen et al. and Taddei et al. showed that both overt and subclinical hypothyroidism were associated with endothelial dysfunction and impaired FMD. They explained this partly by mild dyslipidemia as endothelial dysfunction persisted even after achieving euthyroidism and normolipidemia. They attributed this to the fact that most of their patients were HT and that autoimmune process may still be active in these patients despite levothyroxine substitution and this process could maintain the endothelial dysfunction despite euthyroidism.

Volzke et al. showed that serum TSH levels within the upper reference range are associated with impaired endothelial function. They recommended that upper TSH reference limit should be redefined.

On the other hand, Cabral et al. showed that there is no significant difference observed with respect to FMD between the SCH and control groups. The explanation was that they selected subjects who were matched with respect to age, BMI, smoking, menopausal status, and lipid profile.

5.3. Markers of oxidative stress

Reactive oxygen species (ROS) consist of superoxide anion ($\text{O}_2^-$), hydrogen peroxide ($\text{H}_2\text{O}_2$) and hydroxyl radical ($\text{OH}$), and increased free-radical production leads to oxidative stress with the formation of self-propagating lipid peroxidation.

Primary defense against oxidative stress includes the antioxidant enzymes super oxide dismutase (SOD), glutathione peroxidase (GSHpX) and catalase (CAT). These ROS interact with nucleic acids, proteins and lipids causing cellular dysfunction and even death.

Nitric oxide (NO) is produced by the enzyme NO synthase (NOS). NOS occurs in three forms: endothelial (e) (NOS3), neuronal (n) (NOS1) and inducible (i) (NOS2). The first two are constitutively expressed c-NOS. In general, n- and e-NOS release NO in the nM range whereas i-NOS, following
an induction/latency period, can release NO in the mM range for extended periods of time (often called a high-output source of NO).\(^\text{44}\)

NO derived from c-NOS may occur in two functional forms: the first is always present at low ‘tonal’ or ‘basal’ levels which serve to dampen or control the threshold for activation of vascular and immune cells in response to nonspecific stimuli, i.e. homeostatic, and an enhanced release in response to certain signals, e.g., acetylcholine (ACH). This brief and enhanced release of c-NOS-derived NO can have profound physiological actions, e.g. endothelium-dependent vasodilation, whereas i-NOS is induced by various signal molecules, e.g. proinflammatory cytokines.\(^\text{67}\)

NO, derived from c-NOS, may tonically inhibit i-NOS activity through NF-kB under non-stimulated conditions. However, if the proinflammatory event was extremely strong, i-NOS induction probably cannot be diminished.\(^\text{67}\)

NO has a role as a neurotransmitter and a regulator of blood pressure, it has vasodilator and antiplatelet, tumoricidal, and microbicidal activities.\(^\text{68}\) NO is converted under aerobic conditions to nitrite, and low concentrations of nitrite inhibit myeloperoxidase-mediated oxidation of LDL. NO also acts as an antioxidant by scavenging alkoxyl and peroxyl radicals. When NO is in excess of the surrounding oxidants, lipid oxidation and monocyte margination into the vascular wall are attenuated, producing anti-atherogenic effects.\(^\text{43}\)

ROS can reduce NO bioavailability in endothelium by three mechanisms: (1) in the presence of O\(^\cdot\)\(^-\) by the formation of peroxynitrite, (2) inhibition of e-NOS, and (3) uncoupling of e-NOS with decreased NO and increased O\(^\cdot\)\(^-\) production, this is followed by endothelial dysfunction and atherogenesis.\(^\text{69}\)

Every time NO and superoxide collide, they form peroxynitrite non-enzymatically and very rapidly. Under proinflammatory conditions, simultaneous production of superoxide and NO can be strongly activated to increase production 1000-fold, which will increase the formation of peroxynitrite by a 1000,000-fold.\(^\text{62}\)

The peroxynitrite anion (ONOO\(^-\)) is an effective means of producing hydroxyl radical OH\(^\cdot\), which oxidizes LDL.\(^\text{43}\) Peroxynitrite may contribute to endothelial dysfunction by various mechanisms including: (1) triggering apoptosis and/or necrosis in endothelial and vascular smooth muscle cells, (2) inducing upregulation of adhesion molecules in endothelial cells, (3) enhancing neutrophils adhesion and other mechanisms.\(^\text{69}\)

Furthermore, clinically relevant concentrations of 3-nitrotyrosine, a marker of peroxynitrite load, result in concentration-dependent impairment of acetylcholine-induced, endothelium-dependent vascular relaxation. Numerous studies have demonstrated increased 3-nitrotyrosine and i-NOS expression in human atherosclerotic tissue, which correlated with plaque instability in patients.\(^\text{62}\)

i-NOS-derived peroxynitrite has a central component of inflammation. Expression of inducible NOS, which is associated with increased peroxynitrite production, resulted in increased apoptotic cell death in atheromatous plaques of human coronary arteries.\(^\text{43,44}\)

Our results show that serum NO is significantly higher in overt hypothyroidism compared to the control and correlated positively to TSH and negatively to F.T4, univariate analysis showed that NO was also correlated to anti-TPO antibodies, total cholesterol, LDL cholesterol.

Regarding the effect of the cause of hypothyroidism on serum NO, we observed that NO was not significantly different in the three studied groups of overt hypothyroidism; also, both univariate and multivariate analyzes of different factors which affect CIMT and FMD showed that NO was an independent predictor of both FMD and CIMT.

Coria et al. showed somewhat similar results to ours, they proved that NO concentration significantly increased in overt hypothyroidism compared to the euthyroidism. Also NO in SCH tends to increase, though this was not significant compared to euthyroidism.\(^\text{70}\)

Moustafa et al. demonstrated that serum total T3 showed negative correlation with serum NO, in a similar way we demonstrated a negative relation between F.T4 and NO. They explained their finding by the antioxidant function of thyroid hormones in two ways: by increasing ATP cycling, which enhances oxidative phosphorylation and decreases the formation of ROS and by increasing the supply of NADPH necessary for the regeneration of reduced glutathione (GSH), thus facilitating the scavenging of ROS.\(^\text{71}\)

Kumari et al., unlike our results, showed that serum nitric oxide exhibits almost no change in hypothyroidism when compared to the normal levels.\(^\text{72}\) Ozcan et al. on the other hand demonstrated that the NO levels in serum of the hypothyroid were lower than in the euthyroid controls.\(^\text{73}\)

The apparent discrepancy in our results between impaired FMD (denoting impaired e-NOS derived NO availability) and increased serum NO can be resolved by the following arguments.

Virdis et al. demonstrated a significant i-NOS induction, together with an increased superoxide production, and impaired

---

**Table 6** Multivariate analysis of different factors which affect FMD in patients with hypothyroidism.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Unstandardized coefficients</th>
<th>Standardized coefficients</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Std. Error</td>
<td>Beta</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constant</td>
<td>21.819</td>
<td>1.310</td>
<td>16.650</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diagnosis</td>
<td>0.458</td>
<td>0.084</td>
<td>0.201</td>
<td>5.440</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TG</td>
<td>0.002</td>
<td>0.003</td>
<td>0.024</td>
<td>0.700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TC</td>
<td>0.001</td>
<td>0.006</td>
<td>0.011</td>
<td>0.147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LDL</td>
<td>−0.066</td>
<td>0.009</td>
<td>−0.617</td>
<td>−7.126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F.T4</td>
<td>−0.079</td>
<td>0.039</td>
<td>−0.084</td>
<td>−2.028</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TSH</td>
<td>0.006</td>
<td>0.018</td>
<td>0.026</td>
<td>0.324</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anti-TPO</td>
<td>−0.002</td>
<td>0.002</td>
<td>−0.023</td>
<td>−0.926</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NO</td>
<td>−0.036</td>
<td>0.005</td>
<td>−0.394</td>
<td>−7.744</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
endothelium-dependent relaxation in hypothyroidism. All these changes were reversible by i-NOS blockade and antioxidants.

These findings suggest opposing effects of hypothyroidism on i-NOS and e-NOS where there is an induction of i-NOS with increased NO and O$_2^-$ (hence peroxynitrite formation), and down regulation of e-NOS with loss of tonal and stimulated e-NOS derived NO leading to non-dampening of vascular and immune cells activation and loss of endothelium-dependent vasodilation.\textsuperscript{74}

A second argument to resolve discrepancy is that endothelial-dependent vasodilation EDV may not be NO dependent after all; supporting this hypothesis raised by Tschakovsky and Pyke are the following observations.

With an increase in shear stress at least three vasodilators are known to increase (NO, prostacyclin, endothelium-derived hypopolarizing factor). The FMD response to more sustained stimuli was mediated by NO-independent mechanism(s). Accordingly, FMD in response to sustained shear stress may constitute a critical component of endothelial function for which NO may not be obligatory. Shear stimulus also evokes a potent vasoconstrictor, endothelin. Thus alterations in endothelin release by the vascular endothelium would be expected to influence FMD.

Taken together, the common assumption that FMD represents NO-mediated endothelial function may be misleading in understanding endothelial function.\textsuperscript{75}

To our knowledge, this is the first study to show that HT is an independent cardiovascular risk factor in clinically hypothyroid patients, Bilir et al. found no statistically significant difference regarding CIMT between 59 hypothyroid patients classified according to the cause of hypothyroidism; HT, postsurgical and post-radioiodine.

Possible mechanisms explaining the increased cardiovascular risk in Hashimoto thyroiditis

1. Low grade chronic inflammation leading to endothelial dysfunction: the association between low grade inflammation and endothelial function was demonstrated by Taddei et al., they showed that COX-2 dependent low grade inflammation as evidenced by high hs-CRP and IL-6 in patients with SCH due to Hashimoto thyroiditis causes impairment of endothelium-dependent vasodilation.\textsuperscript{76} Taddei et al. proposed two possible mechanisms for systemic inflammation: high TSH itself may induce inflammation as evidenced by its ability to induce TNF-α production, but the persistence of impaired EDV even after l-thyroxine replacement and achieving euthyroidism precludes this explanation. The second and more accepted mechanism is the chronic stimulation of the immune system by Hashimoto thyroiditis, the persistence of only elevated ESR and thyroid Abs after achieving euthyroidism proves a role for Hashimoto thyroiditis in the residual endothelial dysfunction.\textsuperscript{64}

2. Increased oxidative stress: in the aforementioned study by Taddei et al., they demonstrated that vitamin C (an antioxidant compound capable of scavenging superoxide anions at high concentrations) significantly improved EDV. They suggested that oxidative stress may be the pathogenetic mechanism linking inflammation to endothelial dysfunction.\textsuperscript{76} Gerenova et al. demonstrated lower activities of Catalase and Glutathione peroxidase in euthyroid Hashimoto thyroiditis, suggesting an increased oxidative stress.\textsuperscript{77} In addition, our work showed that nitric oxide as a marker of oxidative stress was an independent predictor of both CIMT and FMD in clinically hypothyroid patients.

Evidence from clinical trials linking euthyroid Hashimoto thyroiditis to increased cardiovascular risk and impaired health status demonstrated the following observations: (1) increased CIMT in overweight and obese women probably due to decreased immune tolerance in obesity, (2) increased IL-6, a key cytokine in atherosclerosis, (3) lower endothelial-dependent arterial dilation linked to autoimmunity and elevated LP(a), (4) impaired right and left ventricular function and cardiac autonomic dysfunction, (5) increased arterial stiffness in women and finally (6) decreased quality of life and early pregnancy loss.\textsuperscript{78–83} Staii et al. recently reported that euthyroid cytology proven HT has a similar prevalence to that of type 2 diabetes.\textsuperscript{84}

In conclusion, to our knowledge, this is the first study to show that HT is an independent cardiovascular risk factor. Given its high prevalence, HT may have an impact on cardiovascular health that is more or less similar to that of type 2 diabetes.

References

Hashimoto thyroiditis is an independent cardiovascular risk factor in clinically hypothyroid patients


