

## Original Article

### COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF BOTTLED AND SACHET WATER SOLD IN URBAN AND RURAL AREAS OF EDO STATE, NIGERIA.

Akinnibosun, F. I. and Ugbawa, L. A.

Department of Microbiology, Faculty of Life Sciences, University of Benin, P.M.B 1154, Benin City.

#### ABSTRACT

This study was aimed at comparatively studying the microbiological quality of several bottled and sachet water sold in Edo State. Microbial counts included total heterotrophic bacterial count (THBC), Total coliform count (TCC) and Total Fungal count (TFC). Counts for urban bottled water ranged from 0.0 to  $6.5 \times 10^6$  for THBC and no count for TCC and TFC. Urban sachet water had 0.0 to  $7.5 \times 10^6$  for THBC, 0.0 to  $1.8 \times 10^6$  for TCC and none for TFC. Counts for rural bottled water ranged from 0.0 to  $2.0 \times 10^6$  for TFC. Rural sachet water had 0.0 to  $3.1 \times 10^6$  for THBC and no count for TCC and TFC. The bacteria isolated from the samples were *Micrococcus luteus*, *Bacillus subtilis*, *Staphylococcus aureus* and *Klebsiella* sp. And the fungus isolated from the samples was *Saccharomyces* sp. It was shown that most of the brands of the sachet water had bacterial growth, hence, the word 'pure water used instead of sachet water' is practically incorrect. This may be as a result of poor handling. Educating the water handlers i.e sellers, distributors and producers could be of help in reducing or eradicating incidences of water transmitted infections.

**Keywords:** Coliform, Sachet water, Bacteriological analysis, Drinking water, Potable water.

---

**Corresponding author Email:** [fakinnibosun@yahoo.co.uk](mailto:fakinnibosun@yahoo.co.uk) ; Telephone: +234(0)8146247781

---

## INTRODUCTION

Water is indispensable for life. However, it is estimated that about 1.2 billion individuals worldwide do not have access to portable water (WHO, 2005, Okonko et al., 2009b). In many developing countries, availability of water has become a critical and urgent problem and it is a matter of great concern to families and communities that depend on non-public water supply system (Okonko et al., 2008). Lack of adequate supply of portable water is a critical challenge in Nigeria. Increase in the human population has exerted an enormous pressure on the provision of safe drinking water in developing countries (Umeh et al., 2005). Portable water also called drinking water in reference to its intended use, is defined as water which is fit for consumption by humans and other animals (Tchobanoglous et al., 2003). The usual source of drinking water is the streams, rivers, wells and boreholes which are mostly untreated and associated with various health risks (Agbarie and Obi, 2009). To curb this health problem, bottled water was introduced, but only individuals who have good financial status can afford these products. Low-income earners are left with no option but to consume sachet packaged water that is cheaper. It is readily available and affordable; sachet water is sold in most roadside vending food stalls in Nigeria.

Water of good drinking quality is of basic importance to human physiology and man's continued existence depends very much on its availability (Lamikanra, 1999; Okonko et al., 2008a, b). Water-related diseases continue to be one of the major health problems globally (Oladipo et al., 2009). Unsafe water is a global public health threat, placing persons at risk for a host of diarrheal and other diseases as well as chemical intoxications (Hughes and Koplan, 2005). Biological contaminants such as bacteria, viruses, fungi, protozoa and helminths constitute the major cause of food-borne and water-borne diseases with varying degrees of severity, ranging from a mild indisposition to chronic or life-threatening illness, or both (Okonko et al., 2009b). Small nylon sachets which are electrically heated

and sealed at both ends are used to packaged 50-60ml of water and these were introduced into the market in Nigeria (Umeh et al., 2005; Alli et al., 2011). There are many different brands of sachet drinking water that are beautifully packaged, properly labelled and advertised (Ekwunife et al., 2010).

Although these products are popularly termed "pure water", they are usually not free of microbial contaminants (Caroli et al., 2005; Taura et al., 2005; Ezeugwunne et al., 2009; Oladipo et al., 2009). Occasionally, contamination of sachet water may occur either during the processing, transportation or improper handling by hawkers. Moreover, a greater proportion of the water that is used for the production of sachet water is obtained from boreholes that are exposed to microbial contamination through rainfall runoffs and the fact that they are usually constructed very close to pit toilets (Adegoke et al., 2012).

Many people in rural and urban communities rely on sachet water and or borehole water as the source(s) of their drinking water supply. The integrity of these sachet water is doubtful, in fact, unconfirmed report abounds that most of the vendors do not treat their sachet waters before selling to the public (Oladipo et al., 2009).

Several studies on the microbial quality of bottled and sachet water have reported violations of international quality standards. Over the recent years, however, concerns have been raised over the microbial quality of drinking water (Fewtrell et al., 1997; Rosenberg, 2003; Khaniki et al., 2010). The bacteriological analysis of water samples provides essential information of the quality and indicates whether or not the water is in a bacteriological acceptable condition (Akinnibosun and Ekundayo, 2007; Atlas, 1988). It may also indicate why and from where the deterioration of quality has occurred. The examination also indicates the degree of pollution present. Due to the difficulty and time consumed in doing routine tests for pathogenic organisms, some bacteria are used as indicators of water quality (Bank, 1994). These are

normal excreta organisms. This kind of practice can be justified because the greatest danger associated with drinking water is that it may be contaminated with human and animal wastes. The wastes may contain both pathogenic and normal excreta organisms (Akinnibosun and Ekundayo, 2007).

The normal excretal organisms can be detected more easily in water, microbiologists, therefore routinely use organisms as indicators of faecal contamination or pollution. The most widely used indicator for microbial water contaminant is the coliforms group of micro-organisms. Coliforms are used as an indicator of water contamination because many of them inhabit the intestinal tract of humans and other animals in large number, thus, their presence in water indicates faecal contamination. The aim of this work was to comparatively analyze bottled and sachet water sold in urban and rural areas in Edo state.

## MATERIALS AND METHODS

### Collection of samples

Bottled and sachet water samples were purchased from urban (G.R.A, Ekenuwan and Ugbowo) and Rural (Udo and Oluku) areas of Edo state.

### Enumeration of microorganisms

Nutrient agar was used to determine the total heterotrophic bacterial count (THBC) while potato dextrose agar was used to determine the fungal count. Ten-fold serial dilution was made and 1ml of from the 10<sup>-1</sup> dilution was plated out by pour plate method on nutrient agar and potato dextrose agar. The nutrient agar plates were incubated at 37°C for 24hrs, while the potato dextrose agar plates were incubated at 28°C for 72hrs. After incubation, discrete colonies of culture on nutrient agar and potato dextrose agar plates were counted and expressed in colony forming unit per ml (CFU/ml).

Determination and Estimation of Total Coliform count:

The Most Probable Number (MPN) technique was used for the water analysis (APHA, 1998).

### Characterization and Identification of Isolate:

Bacteria isolates were identified on the basis of cultural, morphological and biochemical tests according to Jolt et al., 1994 and Cheesbrough, 1984. The fungal colonies were identified as described by Harrigan, 1998.

### Physico-chemical analysis:

Some physicochemical parameters (pH, turbidity, taste, odour and appearance) were analysed according to the methods in APHA, 1998.

## RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

This study was aimed at comparatively analyzing bottled and sachet water sold in urban and rural areas in Edo state. pH is the measure of hydrogen ion concentration or hydroxide ions concentrations in a solution. From the results, the pH of the water samples ranged between 6.45-7.1. The results were within the normally acceptable range (6.0-9.0). The pH of the water samples was within the Nigerian Standard for Drinking Water (NSDW) range acceptable for normal consumption. The result compares well with studies of Adefemi et al., (2007) in water samples from Ureje, Egbe, Ero and Itapaji dams, South West of Nigeria. Asaolu, (1997) also obtained similar results from water samples from the coastal regions of Ondo state, Southwest of Nigeria.

Turbidity is the cloudiness or haziness of water sample. It is usually caused by suspended solid particles which can be as a result of the presence of phytoplankton in open waters or in drinking water. The more turbid the water, the greater the chances of water-borne diseases. This is because contaminants like bacteria and viruses attached to these suspended solids and are protected by these solids from disinfection by chlorination or UV sterilization (USEPA, 1986). The Nigerian Standard for Drinking Water (NSDW)

acceptable standard is 5 NTU. From the results, the turbidity of the potable water ranged between 0.19-0.38 NTU. This showed that the water samples are safe for drinking. The taste and odour of water samples were unobjectionable and the appearance was clear. The result of this study showed the presence of bacteria in the water samples studied. The Counts for urban bottled water ranged from 0.0 to  $6.5 \times 10$  for THBC and no count for TCC and TFC. Urban sachet water had 0.0 to  $7.5 \times 10$  for THBC, 0.0 to  $1.8 \times 10$  for TCC and none for TFC. Counts for rural bottled water ranged from 0.0 to  $2.0 \times 10$  for TFC. Rural sachet water had 0.0 to  $3.1 \times 10$  for THBC and no count for TCC and TFC.

The bacteria detected in the water samples were *Micrococcus luteus*, *Bacillus subtilis*, *Staphylococcus aureus* and *Klebsiella* sp, while the fungal organism detected was *Saccharomyces* sp. This is similar to the studies by Adekunle et al., (2004). In Ibadan, Ezeugwunne et al., (2009) in Nnewi Oladipo et al., (2009) in Ogbomoso, all in Nigeria which showed the presence of some bacteria in sachet and water. *Staphylococcus aureus* and *Klebsiella* sp were mostly detected in the table water samples while *Micrococcus luteus*, *Bacillus subtilis*, and *Staphylococcus aureus* were mostly detected in the sachet water samples. The presence of *Staphylococcus* and *Micrococcus* sp could be as a result of ubiquitous nature of the organism or poor staff handling during water processing (Edema et al., 2001). The presence *Klebsiella* sp. and *Bacillus subtilis* may be as a result of the contaminated vending machine (Oladipo et al., 2009). Similar species of bacteria were isolated from wastewater and surface of the sachets with the wastewater containing a significant higher numbers of bacteria while Adegoke et al., (2011) reported the presence of high microbial load of *Proteus* sp, *Klebsiella* sp, *Enterobacter* sp, *Pseudomonas* sp, *Staphylococcus* sp and *Escherichia coli* in borehole water at Oyigbo, Rivers state suggesting that those borehole water did not meet WHO standard. The international standards for drinking water state that potable water should not contain 100 cells of heterotrophic bacteria per 100ml of water (WHO, 1984). The study of the bottled and sachet water samples collected from both rural and urban areas in Edo

state met up with this standard and this could be as a result of proper location of the water source and effective treatment which the water has received, therefore the public who drink these water could be free from water-borne diseases.

There was coliform detected in water sample G collected. No fungal count was also detected in the water samples except M table water (Iguobazuwa). The presence of coliform bacteria, an indicator bacteria is used to evaluate the quality of drinking water. World Health Organization (WHO) standards for treated water says that no sample of 100ml should contain more than three coliform organisms and *Escherichia coli* should not be detected in any sample of 100ml (WHO,1984). Egwari, et al., (2005) in their study on the bacteriology of sachet water sold in Lagos reported that organisms contained in the wastewater were inevitably the source of contaminants on the sachet surface. Egwari, et al., (2005) in their study on the bacteriology of sachet and bottled water sold in Lagos reported that enteric pathogens and *Escherichia coli* were not isolated from any samples and the water vendors and their patrons contributed to the overall contamination of hawked sachet water in Lagos. Again, the water samples studied in this work except G met up with this standard which could be attributed to the effective water treatment and proper location of water source away from sewage tanks. In order to protect public health and ensure that water is safe for public use, any water intended for drinking treated or untreated, piped or unpiped must meet a certain microbiological standard. A violation of set standards warrants treatment of the present source or the need for an alternative water supply.

A study conducted in Lagos, Nigeria revealed that bacteriological characteristic of sachet water deteriorates considerably as products moved farther down the distribution chain. Less than 7% of sachet water contamination took place after production while between 40 and 45% of the products were observed between the distribution sheds and the street hawkers (Omalu et al., 2010). Egwari, et al., (2005) in their study on bacteriology of sachet water sold in Lagos reported that enteric pathogens and *Escherichia coli* were not isolated

from any samples and brands of sachet water but formed significant part of the isolates on the sachet surfaces of samples collected from the cooling receptacles (pail, wheelbarrow and refrigerator).

Table 1: Physico-chemical Parameters of the Water Samples

Water samples	Ph	Turbidity	Taste	Odour	Appearance
A	6.71	0.21	U	U	C
B	6.82	0.37	U	U	C
C	6.8	0.31	U	U	C
D	6.84	0.25	U	U	C
E	6.72	0.19	U	U	C
F	6.84	0.22	U	U	C
G	6.77	0.29	U	U	C
H	6.81	0.28	U	U	C
I	7.1	0.41	U	U	C
J	6.83	0.33	U	U	C
K	6.66	0.38	U	U	C
L	6.75	0.25	U	U	C
M	6.85	0.29	U	U	C
N	7.4	0.3	U	U	C
O	7.1	0.19	U	U	C
P	6.45	0.25	U	U	C
Q	6.82	0.2	U	U	C
R	7.1	0.28	U	U	C
S	7.4	0.31	U	U	C
T	7.1	0.34	U	U	C
U	7	0.27	U	U	C
V	6.83	0.19	U	U	C
W	6.9	0.22	U	U	C
X	6.81	0.28	U	U	C

Key:

- C = clear/colourless
- U = unobjectionable
- A = Aqua Baula Table water (Ekenhuan)
- B = Big Joe Table water (Ekenhuan)
- C = Notre Dame Table water (GRA)

- D = Eva Table Water (GRA)
- E = Olivia Table Water (ugbowo)
- F = Uniben Table Water (ugbowo)
- G = Notre Dame Sachet Water (Ugbowo)
- H = Uniben Sachet Water (ugbowo)
- I = Europa Sachet Water (Ekenhuan)
- J = Notre Dame Sachet water (Ekenhuan)
- K = Dewlife Sachet Water (GRA)
- L = Nelan Sachet Water (GRA)
- M = CJ table Water (Iguobazuwa)
- N = Ven Table Water (Iguobazuwa)
- O = Dewlife Table Water (Oluku)
- P = Claire Table Water (Oluku)
- Q = Olivia Table Water (Udo)
- R = Samis Table Water (Udo)
- S = Uwa Sachet Water (Iguobazuwa)
- T = De-city Sachet Water (Iguobazuwa)
- U = Noren Sachet Water (Oluku)
- V = Adima Sachet Water (Oluku)
- W = IK Table Water (Udo)
- X = Kelda Table Water (Udo)

Table 2: Microbial Counts of Urban Bottled water

Samples	THBC (cfu/ml)	TCC (cfu/ml)	TFC (cfu/ml)
A	0	0	0
B	6.5 x 10	0	0
C	5.6 x 10	0	0
D	0	0	0
E	0	0	0
F	0	0	0

Key:

- THBC = Total Heterotrophic Bacterial count
- TCC = Total Coliform Count
- TFC = Total Fungal Count

Table 3: Microbial Counts of Urban Sachet water

Samples	THBC (cfu/ml)	TCC (cfu/ml)	TFC (cfu/ml)
G	7.5 x 10	1.8 x 10	0
H	2.0 x 10	0	0
I	1.0 x 10	0	0
J	0	0	0
K	1.9 x 10	0	0
L	7.0 x 10	0	0

Key:

THBC = Total Heterotrophic Bacterial count

TCC = Total Coliform Count

TFC = Total Fungal Count

Table 4: Microbial Counts of Rural Bottled water

Samples	THBC (cfu/ml)	TCC (cfu/ml)	TFC (cfu/ml)
M	2.1 x 10	0	2.0 x 10
N	2.0 x 10	0	0
O	7.5 x 10	0	0
P	7.5 x 10	0	0
Q	0	0	0
R	2.1 x 10	0	0

Key:

THBC = Total Heterotrophic Bacterial count

TCC = Total Coliform Count

TFC = Total Fungal Count

Table 5: Microbial Counts of Rural Sachet water

Samples	THBC (cfu/ml)	TCC (cfu/ml)	TFC (cfu/ml)
S	0	0	0
T	3.1 x 10	0	0
U	1.3 x 10	0	0
V	0	0	0
W	0	0	0
X	1.0 x 10	0	0

Key:

THBC = Total Heterotrophic Bacterial count

TCC = Total Coliform Count

TFC = Total Fungal Count

Table 6: Bacteria Isolated from the Samples

Isolated Bacteria
<i>Micrococcus luteus</i>
<i>Bacillus</i> sp.
<i>Staphylococcus aureus</i>
<i>Klebsiella</i> sp.

Table 7: Fungus Isolated from Samples

Isolated Fungus
<i>Saccharomyces</i> sp.

## CONCLUSION

It was shown that most of the brands of the Sachet Water had bacterial growth, hence, the word "Pure Water" used instead of Sachet Water is practically incorrect. This may be a result of poor handling. Educating the water handlers' i.e. sellers, distributors and producers could be of help in reducing or eradicating incidences of water transmitted infections.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The authors would like to thank the Department of Microbiology, Faculty of Life Sciences,

The University of Benin, Benin City for the provision of materials for this work.

## REFERENCES

Adefemi OS, Asaolu SS. and Olaofe O (2007). Assessment of the physicochemical Status of water Samples from Major Dams in Ekiti State, Nigeria. *Pak. Nut* 6(6) 657-659.

Adegoke OA, Bamigbowu EO and Okpo KS. (2011). Bacteriology assessment of borehole water in Oyigbo Town, River State, Nigeria. *International Journal of Applied Biological Research*. 3(1): 47 - 55.

Adegoke OA, Bamigbowu EO, Oni ES and Ugbaja KN (2012). Microbiological examination of sachet water sold in Aba, Abia State, Nigeria. *Global Research Journal of Microbiology* 2(1): 62-66.

Adekunle LV, Sridhar MKC, Ajayi AA, Oluwade PA and Olawuyi JF (2004). An assessment of the health and social economic implications of sachet water in Ibadan, Nigeria: A public health challenge. *African Journal of Biomedical Research* 7(1): 5-8.

Agbaire PO and Obi CG (2009). Seasonal Variations of Some Physico-Chemical Properties of River

Ethiopia Water in Abraka Nigeria. *J. Appl. Sci. Environ. Mgt.* 13(1): 55-57.

Akinnibosun FI and Ekundayo JA (2007). Bacteriological and Physico-chemical analysis of commercial "pure water" in Benin City. *Tropical Journal of Environmental Science and Health*. 10(1): 49-56.

Alli JAI, Okonko IO, Alabi OAI, Odu NN, Kolade AFI, Nwanze JC, Onoh C and Mgbakor CI (2011). Parasitological evaluation of some vended sachet water in Southwestern Nigeria. *New York Science Journal* 4(10): 84-92.

American Public Health Association (APHA) (1998). *Standard Methods for the Examination of Water and Wastewater* 20th edn. Washington. APHA; U.S.A.

Asaolu SS, Ipinmoroti KO, Adeyinowo CE and Olaofe O (1997). Interrelationship of heavy metals concentration in water. Sediment as fish samples from Ondo State coastal area. *Nig. African Journal of Science*. 1: 55-61.

Atlas RM (1988). *Microbiology: Fundamental and Applications* 2nd Edition, Macmillan Publishing Company, New York 807pp.

Bank N (1994). *The goal: Safe-water and Sanitation for all*. Atlas World Water. Sterling Publications Limited, United Kingdom. 457pp.

Caroli G, Levre E, Armani G, Biffi-Gentili S and Molinani G (1985). Search for Acid-Fast Bacilli in Bottled Mineral Water. *Journal of Applied Bacteriology*, 85: 461-463.

Cheesbrough M, (1984). Bacteriological Testing of Water. In: *District Laboratory Practice in Tropical Countries*. 11: 149-154.

Edema MO, Omemu AM and Fapetu OM. (2001). Microbiology and physiology analysis of different sources of drinking water in Abeokuta, Nigeria. *Journal of Microbiology*. 15(1): 57 -61.



Egwari LO, Iwuanyan S, Ojelabi CI, Uzochukwu O and Effiok WW (2005). Bacteriology of Sachet water sold in Lagos, Nigeria. *East African Medical Journal*. 82: 235-240.

Ekwunife CA, Okafor SO, Ukaga CN, Ozumba NA and Eneanya CI (2010). Parasites Associated with Sachet Drinking Water (Pure Water) in Awka, South-Eastern, Nigeria. *Sierra Leone Journal of Biomedical Research* 1: 23-27.

Ezeugwunne IP, Agbakoba NR, Nnamah NK and Anahalu IC (2009). Prevalence of bacteria in packaged sachets water sold in Nnewi, South East Nigeria. *World Journal of Dairy and Food Sciences*. 4(1): 19 -21.

Fewtrell L, Kay D, Wyer M, Godfree A and Neill GO (1997). Microbiological quality of bottled water. *Water Science and Technology*. 34: 47-53.

Hughes JM. and Koplan JP. (2005). Saving Lives through Global Safe Water. *Journal of Emerging Infectious Disease* 11(10): 1636-1637.

Jolt TG, Krieg NR, Sneath PHA, Stanley TT and Williams, S.T. (1994). *Bergey's manual of systemic bacteriology*. Williams and Wilkins Co. Baltimore, Maryland 9th edition 786pp.

Khaniki GRJ, Zarei A, Kamkar A, Fazlzadehdavil M, Ghaderpoori M, and Zarei A. (2010) Bacteriological evaluation of bottled water from domestic brands in Tehran markets in Iran. *World Applied Science Journal*. 8(3): 274 -278.

Lamikanra A. (1999). *Essential Microbiology for students and practioner of Pharmacy, Medicine and microbiology*, 2nd edn, Amkra books, Lagos, pp 406.

Okonko IO, Ogun AA, Adejaye OD, Ogunjobi AA, Nkang AO and Adebayo-Tayo BC. (2009b). Hazards analysis critical control points (HACCP) and Microbiology qualities of Sea-foods as affected by Handler's Hygiene in Ibadan and Lagos, Nigeria. *African Journal of Food Sciences*. 3(1): 035-050.

Okonko IO, Ogunjobi AA, Adejaye AD, Ogunnusi TA. and Olasogba MC (2008b). Comparative studies and microbial risk assessment of different water samples used for processing ferozen ssea foods in Ijora-olopa, Lagos State. Nigeria. *African Journal of Biotechnology*. 7(16): 2902-2907.

Okonko IO, Ogunnusi TA, Adejaye OD and Shittu OB (2008a). Microbiological and Physicochemical Analysis of Different Water Samples Use for Domestic Purposes in Abeokuta, Ogun State and Ojota, Lagos State, Nigeria. *African Journal of Biotechnology*. 7(5): 617-621.

Oladipo IC, Onyeike IC and Adebisi AO. (2009). Microbiological Analysis of Some Vended Sachet Water in Ogbomosho, Nigeria. *African Journal of Food Science*. 3(12): 406-412.

Omalu ICJ, Olayemi IK, Gbesi SLA, Adeniran AV, Ayanwale AZ, Mohammed JA and

Chukwuemeka V. (2010). Contamination of sachet water. *Microbiology Reviews* 11(1): 142-201.

Omemu AM, Edema MO and Bankole MO (2005). Bacteriological Assessment of Street Vended Ready-to Eat (RTE) Vegetables and Packaged Salad in Lagos. Nigeria. *Nigerian Journal of Microbiology* 19: 497-504.

Rosenberg FA (2003). The microbiology of bottled water. *Clinical Microbiology Newsletter*. 25: 41-44.

Taura DW, Mukhtar MD and Kano AN (2005). Assessment of Microbial Safety of Some Brands of Yoghurts Sold Around Old Campus of Bayero University, Kano. Nigeria *Journal of Microbiology*, 19: 521-528.

Tchobanoglous G, Burton FL and Stensel HD. (2003). *Wastewater Engineering (Treatment and Disposal Reuse) /Metcalf & Eddy, Inc. (4th Edition ed.)* McGraw-Hill Book Company.

Umeh CN, Okorie OI and Emesiani GA (2005). Towards the provision of safe drinking water: The bacteriological quality and safety of sachet water in Awka, Anambra State. In: the book of Abstract of



the 29th Annual Conference & General Meeting on Microbes As Agents of Sustainable Development, organized by Nigerian Society for Microbiology (NSM), University of Agriculture Abeokuta, pp 22.

US Environmental Protection Agency (EPA). (1986). Ambient Water Quality Criteria for Dissolved Oxygen. US Environmental Protection Agency, Washington, D.C. EPA 440/ 5-86-003.

World Health Organization (2005). The WHO report - makes every mother and child count Geneva: The organization 2005.

World Health Organization (WHO). (1984). Guidline for water quality volume 1, H.M.S.O. Publication, London pp 6-9.