Low sputum smear positive tuberculosis among pulmonary tuberculosis suspects in a tertiary hospital in Mwanza, Tanzania

JEREMIAH SENI*, BENSON R. KIDENYA1, EMMANUEL OBASSY1, MARIAM MIRAMBO1, VENANCE BURUSHI1, HUMPHREY D. MAZIGO1, ANTONY KAPESA1, MTEBE MAJIGO2 and STEPHEN E. MSHANA1

1Catholic University of Health and Allied Sciences-Bugando P.O. Box 1464 Mwanza, Tanzania
2Institute of Human Virology, University of Maryland School of Medicine, USA

Abstract: Early diagnosis of tuberculosis (TB) and prompt initiation of treatment are essential for an effective tuberculosis control programme. In many resource limited settings microscopic diagnosis is still the pivotal tool in the diagnosis of pulmonary TB. This study aimed at evaluating laboratory microscopic diagnosis of tuberculosis in a tertiary hospital in Mwanza, Tanzania. This retrospective hospital based study reviewed consecutively from TB registry and patients' files a total of 5,922 TB suspects who submitted their sputum for examination between January 2007 and May 2010 at Bugando Medical Centre (BMC). Among TB suspects (mean age=36.1±13.6 years) female accounted for 54.1% of the patients. The prevalence of HIV among TB patients was 59.4%. The sputum smear positivity rate among the TB suspects was 6.1%; the rate was higher in HIV positive than in HIV negative patients (9.9 % versus 3.2%, P-value < 0.001). The overall positivity rate for the first smear was 94.2% with an incremental percentage yield of 5.2% and 0.6% for the second and third smears, respectively. The study found that 28.6% of patients who were positive in the first smear did not return for the second smear. The risk factors among smear positive TB patients were co-illness (32.5%), previous history of TB (7.5%) and history of positive TB contact (4.7%). These findings also show that as CD4+ T Cells count increases, the quantity AFB in sputum smear also increase although not statistically significant. The sputum smear positivity rate at Bugando Medical Centre is low and more than a quarter of initial TB suspects who were positive in the first smear were lost to follow up posing a threat of continuous transmission of tuberculosis to the community. The finding of more sputum smear positivity rate among HIV positive than HIV negative patients at BMC requires a prospective study to ascertain whether it is a reality or a coincidence.

Key words: Sputum smears, tuberculosis, HIV, Tanzania

Introduction

Tuberculosis (TB) is an important cause of morbidity and mortality in low-income countries (Frieden, 2003). Globally, it is estimated that there are 8.8 million new cases of tuberculosis, of which 3.9 million are sputum smear-positive and, thus, highly infectious (Corbett et al., 2003, WHO, 2005b). In the African region the tuberculosis case rate continues to increase, both because of the epidemic of HIV infection and the poor or absent primary care services in parts of the region (WHO, 1997; Dye et al., 1999; Corbett et al., 2003; Frieden, 2003). Early diagnosis of the disease and prompt initiation of treatment are essential for an effective tuberculosis control programme, therefore rapid

* Correspondence: Jeremiah Seni; Email: senij80@gmail.com
and accurate identification of infected individuals is mandatory (WHO, 2005a; Mandell et al., 2005). Delay in the diagnosis may worsen the disease, increase the risk of death and enhance tuberculosis transmission in the community (Rouillon et al., 1976; Toman, 1979). To confirm the diagnosis of pulmonary TB, *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* from the sputum should be cultured. However, because mycobacterial culture requires expensive equipment and the long turn-around time (WHO, 2005a), the simpler and easier acid-fast bacilli (AFB) Ziehl-Neelsen (ZN) stain is still used widely as the pivotal tool in the diagnosis of TB and evaluation of treatment responses (WHO, 1998, 2001; Enarson et al., 2000). The standard recommendation, to obtain three sputum smears; spot-morning-spot has been implemented in Tanzania (Ipuge et al., 1996; Enarson et al., 2000; MoHSW, 2006). However, currently there is a concern on the value of the third specimen especially in the developing world. Some studies have revealed that the increase in smear positivity obtained with the third specimen is low and probably not cost effective (Harries et al., 1996; Walker et al., 2000; Wu & Wang, 2000; Crampin et al., 2001; Van Deun et al., 2002).

Patients with HIV/AIDS have been shown to pose challenge on microscopic diagnosis of pulmonary TB (PTB) and most literatures have shown that HIV/AIDS is associated with low sputum smear positivity (Klein et al., 1989; Elliot et al., 1993; Karstaedt et al., 1998; Matee et al., 2008), nevertheless other literatures have shown no significant difference between HIV positive and HIV negative patients (Long et al., 1991; Githui et al., 1992; Finch & Beaty, 1997). To increase yield of sputum smear positivity, a number of methods, including concentration of sputum, use of fluorescent microscopy, internal and external quality control have been employed (Rieder et al., 1998; WHO, 2001, 2005; Steingart et al., 2005).

The International Union Against Tuberculosis and Lung Diseases (IUATLD) recommends screening an average of 10 suspects to identify one smear-positive case (IUATLD, 1978). In a study in Tanzania, it was shown that the average proportion of TB cases among TB suspects is 18.9% (range 14.3-23.8%) (Ipuge et al., 1996). However the detection rate in our setting remains unknown. Therefore, this study was carried out to evaluate laboratory microscopic diagnosis of tuberculosis in an area of HIV high endemicity to provide baseline data for Bugando Medical Centre where culture is not routinely done.

Materials and Methods

Study design and patients

This retrospective hospital-based study was conducted at Bugando Medical Centre (BMC) in Mwanza in northern Tanzania. BMC is the referral, consultant and teaching hospital serving approximately 13 million people from six regions around Lake Victoria and Western Zones of Tanzania.

All patients with clinically suspected PTB (MoHSW, 2006) and who submitted their sputum for examination at BMC TB Laboratory between January 2007 to May 2010 were included in the study. The sputum sample results of TB suspects were obtained
from TB laboratory registry. The Bugando Medical Centre TB laboratory does routinely sputum smear microscopy by ZN stain method according to WHO recommended protocol. Briefly the primary stain was done using 0.3% of carbolfuchsins for five minutes; then decolourization with 3% acid alcohol or 25% sulphuric acid for one to two minutes and finally, counterstain with 0.3% methylene blue for one minute (WHO, 1998; Enarson et al., 2000). Patient clinical history, HIV serostatus, CD4+ T cell counts and other demographic characteristics were obtained from TB clinic registry and in patient’ files. TB suspects whose data were missing in the TB registry and/or- files were excluded in the analysis.

Data analysis
Variables from the registry and patient’ files were double entered into the computer, verified and cleaned using Epi info software version 3.1 (CDC, Atlanta) and analysis was done using STATA software version 11 (College Station, Texas). Continuous variables were described as mean (±standard deviation). Categorical variables were described as proportion and were analyzed to compare the significance of difference in distribution by using Chi-square test or Fischer’s exact test where appropriate. The difference in distribution was considered significant if p-value was less than 0.05.

Ethical clearance
The study sought clearance from the Weill Bugando University College of Health Sciences/Bugando Medical Centre research and ethics committee. Permission to conduct the study was obtained from the Director General of BMC, heads of respective departments and TB Coordinator. All patients’ information obtained from TB registry and patient’s files were kept anonymously.

Results
In a period from January 2007 to May 2010 a total 5,922 TB suspects were retrospectively recruited in this study. Among these 3,204 (54.1%) were females and 2,718 (45.9%) were males. The female: male ratio among the TB suspects was 1.17: 1. The mean age was 36.1 ± 13.6 years. Of the studied population 2,171 (36.7%) were HIV positive and 2,197 (37.1%) were HIV negative. The HIV serostatus of 1,554 (26.2%) was unknown. Among the population studied smear positive was detected in 360 (6.1%) patients, of these 214 (59.4%) were HIV positive, 71 (19.7%) were HIV negative and 75 (20.8%) had their HIV serostatus unknown. TB smear positivity rates were significantly higher in HIV positive than in HIV negative (9.9 % vs 3.2%, P-value < 0.001) (Figure 1).
The positivity rate for the first smear was 94.2% with an incremental percentage yield of 5.2% and 0.6% for the second and third smears respectively (Table 1).

Table 1: Incremental yield in the smear positivity among TB positive patients

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Smear Number</th>
<th>Number of positive smear</th>
<th>Incremental percentage yield</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>First smear</td>
<td>339</td>
<td>94.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second smear</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>5.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Third smear</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>360</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The study found that 28.6% (97/339) of patients who were positive in the first smear did not return for the second smear. The clinical characteristics presented by the smear positive TB suspects were persistent productive cough (93.3%), fever (64.2%), recent weight loss (47.5%), night sweats (43.9%) and chest pain (41.7%). Persistent productive cough, chest pain and haemoptysis were observed more frequently among HIV positive than in HIV negative patients; P-values 0.027, <0.0001 and 0.008 respectively (Table 2).

Table 2: Comparison of Clinical characteristics among HIV positive and HIV negative smear positive patients

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Clinical characteristics (N)</th>
<th>HIV Positive n (%)</th>
<th>HIV Negative n (%)</th>
<th>p- value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Persistent cough (264)</td>
<td>194 (73.5)</td>
<td>70 (26.5)</td>
<td>0.027</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fever (185)</td>
<td>135(73.0)</td>
<td>50 (27.0)</td>
<td>0.262</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recent weight loss (134)</td>
<td>97 (72.4)</td>
<td>37 (27.6)</td>
<td>0.321</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Night sweats (130)</td>
<td>98 (75.4)</td>
<td>32 (24.6)</td>
<td>0.915</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Haemoptysis (41)</td>
<td>24 (58.5)</td>
<td>17 (41.5)</td>
<td>0.008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chest pain (111)</td>
<td>69 (62.2)</td>
<td>42 (37.8)</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malaise (96)</td>
<td>68 (70.8)</td>
<td>28 (29.2)</td>
<td>0.237</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The risk factors identified among smear positive TB patients were co-illness (32.5%), previous history of TB (7.5%) and history of positive TB contact (4.7%). Among the
sputum smear positive HIV patients, 147 (68.7%) had their CD4+ T cells count measured and recorded, with the median CD4+ of 161.5 cells/µL (range 1 – 1410 cells/µL). These findings show that as CD4+ T Cells count increases, the quantity AFB in sputum smear also increase although not statistically significant.

Table 3: Quantification of AFB in Sputum Smear Positive Results with CD4+ T Cell Counts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Quantity of AFB in Sputum Smears</th>
<th>≤ AFB 1+</th>
<th>AFB 2+ and 3+</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CD4+ Counts ≤ 200</td>
<td>28 (34.2%)</td>
<td>54 (65.8%)</td>
<td>82 (100.0%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CD4+ Counts &gt; 200</td>
<td>18 (27.7%)</td>
<td>47 (72.3%)</td>
<td>65 (100.0%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chi square 0.702, p-value 0.402.

Discussion

In this study, the mean age was similar to findings from a previous study by Yusuphy et al. (2008). The prevalence of HIV among TB patients of 59.4% in our study correlates to the previous findings elsewhere in Tanzania and other part of Africa (WHO, 1997; MoHSW, 2006, 2008). However, this rate is lower compared to studies from developed countries (Dye et al., 1999; Wang et al., 2009). Among the population studied smear positivity rate was 6.1%, a value lower than the recommended rate of 10% (IUATLD, 1978) and values reported by another study in Tanzania (Ipuge et al., 1996) and in other countries (Yassin & Cuevas, 2003; Saleem et al., 2007). The value of 10% from IUATLD was based on ZN TB Microscopy, so the use of both ZN stain for AFB and fluorescence microscopy as it is in our setting is expected to yield higher detection rate. At Bugando Medical Centre there is no external quality control system, which could explain the low detection rate. Also high index of suspicion of clinician with less stringy criteria at BMC is likely to contribute to the low detection rate.

This study found that HIV infected people were significantly more prone to PTB than HIV negative individuals. Other studies have also reported higher sputum smear positivity rate among HIV positive than HIV negative patients (Garcia et al., 2009; Wanga et al., 2009).

The percentage yield from the first smear was 94.2% with an incremental percentage yield of 5.2% and 0.6% for the second and third smears, respectively. This showed that the role of the third smears is not cost effective as the yield was very low as previously reported (Harries et al., 1996; Wu & Wang, 2000; Crampin et al., 2001; Van Deun et al., 2002; Yassin & Cuevas, 2003). However, a few studies have reported higher values in the second and third smears ((Ipuge et al., 1996; Saleem et al., 2007). The proposed recommendation by WHO to consider reducing the number of smears from three to two (WHO, 2001) is emphasized from our findings.

In this study, two-thirds of the sputum smear positive HIV patients had their CD4+ T cells count measured. There was an insignificant increase in CD4+ count as the quantity AFB in sputum smear increased. Other studies elsewhere have shown a significant association between an increase in CD4+ and increase in the quantify of AFB in sputum smear (Watson & Gill, 1990; Attili et al., 2005).
The study found that just about one-third of patients who were positive in the first smear did not return for the second smear, thus posing a potential risk of transmitting tuberculosis to the community. Already a study by Bruchfeld et al. (2002) have shown that persistent productive cough, chest pain and haemoptysis are more frequent among TB-HIV positive than among TB- HIV negative patients.

Conclusively, the sputum smear positivity rate at Bugando Medical Centre is low and more than a quarter of the TB suspects who are positive in the first smear are lost to follow up posing a threat of continuous transmission of tuberculosis to the community. These findings call for laboratory, clinical and community-based interventions to combat the situation. The proposed recommendation by WHO to consider reducing the number of smears from three to two is emphasized in our findings. The finding of more sputum smear positivity rate among HIV positive than HIV negative at BMC requires a prospective study to ascertain whether it is a reality or a coincidence.

Acknowledgements

The authors would like to express their sincere gratitude to Profs. W.D. Johnson and D. Fitzgerald of Weill Cornell Medical College, USA for provision of grant through Center for Global Health to fund this work. Special thanks to Bugando Medical Centre TB Laboratory and Medical Record personnel for their assistance. Dr. Charles Majinge, the Director General of BMC is thanked for provision of a conducive environment for the study.

References


